Sacred or Secular?

HOW STUDENT PERCEPTIONS CAN GUIDE LIBRARY SPACE DESIGN AND UTILIZATION

Robert E. Fox, Jr.
Dean, University Libraries
University of Louisville

Bruce L. Keisling
Associate Dean of Libraries
University of Louisville
SACRED OR SECULAR?

• Purpose of Study
• Literature Review
• Methodology
• Findings
• Conclusions
Purpose of Study

- Informing library renovations
- Seeking to validate/expand a previous research study
- Addressing lack of literature
- Comparing results between two institutions
- Identifying generalizable data
Literature Review

- “Library as Place”
- Inspirational campus spaces
- Inspirational library spaces
Inspirational campus spaces

“Colleges and universities should never underestimate the power of special, transformational, and even sacred spaces on their campuses.” Sacred campus spaces provide an opportunity to connect students with the institution in “…a deeply personal or spiritual experience that has great meaning.”

Earl Broussard “The Power of Place on Campus” The Chronicle of Higher Education 5/1/09
Inspirational library spaces – What qualities make library space sacred?

- Feelings inspired by the space
- Architectural details
- Inherent quality of the space
- Similarity to religious spaces
Feelings inspired by the space

“…an academic library might invoke spiritual feelings in students.” A student stated that “sometimes, when I go into a beautiful traditional library I feel like I’m going into a church. Not because it feels religious but because I’m filled with a special sense of connectedness to the university’s scholarly traditions.”

Jackson/Hahn “Serving Higher Education’s Highest Goals: Assessment of the Academic Library as Place”
College & Research Libraries September 2011
Feelings inspired by the space

students wanting “rooms that inspire”


students “… want to experience a sense of inspiration.”

Freeman “The Library as Place: Changes in Learning Patterns, Collections, Technology and Use” in Library as Place: Rethinking Roles, Rethinking Space 2005
Architectural details

“mahogany paneling, wooden bookshelves, overstuffed armchairs, and traditional reading rooms with high ceilings and long tables.”

Fister

“the traditional reading room … - the great, vaulted, light-filled space whose walls are lined with books they may never pull off the shelf.”

Freeman
Inherent quality of the space

Use the term “conduciveness to scholarship” in echoing the theme of a library space with value independent of the materials in it.

Antell/Engel “Stimulating Space, Serendipitous Space: Library as Place in the Life of a Scholar” in *The Library as Place* 2007
Similarity to religious spaces

“...while it would be too bold to propose libraries might take the place of churches, there is this parallel: we visit libraries to find quiet space and room for reflections.”

“...it is not mere courtesy that causes people to become silent in the library, as they do in a church: Libraries are sacred places.”
Benton “A Laboratory of Collaborative Learning” The Chronicle of Higher Education 8/7/2009
Could Inspirational Space Lead to Measurable Benefits in Recruiting and Retention?

“People may indeed view it (library space) as a tangible representation of the institution’s abstract mission.”

Jackson/Hahn

Notes that "sacred campus spaces provide an opportunity to connect students with the institution.”
Mentions value of space in regards to creating lasting relationships for alumni.

Broussard
Jackson/Hahn article

Research assessing abstract concepts rather than based on anecdotal evidence or a satisfaction survey

Investigated whether traditional looking library spaces and objects in those spaces made for a more inspirational experience for students and whether those spaces and objects brought about a measurable link to the university’s mission

Created a paper-based survey that was accompanied by a flipbook containing images of traditional and modern spaces as well as library items

In addition to demographic questions, asked for feelings about and expected use of spaces/objects in images and whether they would contribute to the university mission
Literature Review

- Jackson/Hahn article

- Administered to 54 students at three large public research universities (University of AZ, University of IL at Urbana-Champaign, University of MD)

- Concluded that students preferred the traditional spaces to those identified as modern spaces

- Students indicated that they would visit the traditional spaces more frequently

- Traditional spaces were regarded as spiritual to a greater degree than the modern spaces

- Traditional spaces were viewed as being more supportive of the university mission
Suggested four recommendations for further studies:
- having a larger sample size,
- including students from a variety of academic institutions,
- looking at virtual spaces, and
- including public libraries.
Followed two of the Jackson/Hahn recommendations:
- having a larger sample size
- including students from a variety of academic institutions

Created a survey instrument using Jackson/Hahn as a starting point
- Shortened survey eliminating a number of questions
- Decided to only use library images and not include items
Methodology

- Created image pool of library exteriors and interiors
  - Used only library buildings
  - Did not use any local libraries
  - For interiors, used only high ceilings and images with books

- Normed images using student review
Methodology

Traditional Exteriors

Suzzalo Library, University of Washington

Perkins Library, Duke University
Methodology

Modern Exteriors

Hunt Library, North Carolina State University

Thompson Library, Ohio State University
Methodology

Traditional Interiors

Bapst Library, Boston College

Fisher Fine Arts Library, University of Pennsylvania
Methodology

Modern Interiors

Brody Learning Commons, Johns Hopkins University

Philological Library, Free University of Berlin
Met with U of L Institutional Research
- Reviewed draft survey and image pool for question clarity and survey design input
- Decided on online survey
- Use of split-randomization led to four survey versions

Surveys administered over a two-week period
- Four laptops set up at each institution
- Students randomly assigned to a survey version
- 312 completed U of L surveys and 165 completed SBTS surveys
Library Spaces survey instrument

Please answer the following questions about yourself.

1. Gender: □ Male □ Female

2. Age: □ 22 or below □ 23–30 □ 31–50 □ 51–65 □ 66+

3. Student status:
   Undergraduate: □ Freshman □ Sophomore □ Junior □ Senior
   Graduate: □ Master’s student □ Research Doctoral student (Ph. D.) □ Professional doctoral student (J.D., D. Min.)

4. □ Live on-campus □ Live off-campus

5. Major field of study: ________________________________ (fill in the blank)

6. How frequently do you use our library?
   □ Daily □ Weekly □ Monthly □ Less than once a month

7. How frequently do you use the electronic resources provided by the library?
   □ Daily □ Weekly □ Monthly □ Less than once a month
Please examine the image marked “A” above.

This is the main library at a research university. This library houses most of the collections and serves undergraduate and graduate students, faculty, and staff. The library is open 7 days a week and offers reference services, study spaces, and access to computers, scanners/copiers, and printers.

Please answer the following questions regarding this library:

1. My initial feelings about this library are _________.
   □ Very positive □ Somewhat positive □ Neutral/No opinion □ Somewhat negative □ Very negative

2. As a student I would want to use this library _________.
   □ Frequently □ Sometimes □ Infrequently □ Never

3. Choose the *one phrase* that best describes the purpose for which you would be most likely to use this library:

   Independent study
   Group study
   Using hard-copy materials (books, journals, special collections)
   Using electronic library resources (online articles, e-books)
   Using internet-based resources (Web pages, social networking, blogs)
4. The mission statements of most universities and colleges include academic progress, creative accomplishment, cultural enrichment, and social engagement. How well do you feel the library pictured above would support these values?

□ Strongly □ Somewhat □ Minimally □ Not at all

Please reexamine the image. For each of the following pairs, please circle the word that best describes your immediate emotional response to the image.

Overwhelmed Scholarly
Comfortable Uninformed

Focused Studious
Distracted Leisurely

Spiritual/sacred Energized
Secular/non-spiritual Lethargic

Disorganized Organized
FINDINGS
DATA and ANALYSIS

• Spiritual/Secular Results
• Usage Indications
• Mission Statement Support
• Cross-Institutional Comparisons
• Demographic Analysis
• Conclusions
SPIRITUAL VS. SECULAR DESIGNATION

- SBTS Modern
  - Secular: 16%
  - Spiritual: 84%

- UofL Modern
  - Secular: 16%
  - Spiritual: 84%
SPIRITUAL VS. SECULAR DESIGNATION

SBTS Traditional
- Spiritual: 85%
- Secular: 15%

UofL Traditional
- Spiritual: 80%
- Secular: 20%
Baseline Current Use – Combined UofL/SBTS and Jackson/Hahn
(Coded Means)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Modern</th>
<th>Traditional</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UofL/SBTS</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jackson/Hahn</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Responses to “ Likely to Use”
UofL/SBTS
(Coded Means)
Responses to “Likely to Use”
UofL/SBTS and Jackson/Hahn
(Coded Means)
Responses to “Mission Statement Support”
UofL and SBTS
(Coded Means)
Responses to “Mission Statement Support”

UofL/SBTS and Jackson-Hahn

(Coded Means)
Other Word-Pair Responses
UofL/SBTS Modern Images
Other Word-Pair Responses
UofL/SBTS Traditional Images
Other Word-Pair Responses
UofL/SBTS Combined

- Comfortable
- Focused
- Studious
- Scholarly
- Energized
- Organized

Combined

Combined
Phrase to Describe Purpose
UofL/SBTS All Spaces
(Each student voted twice)
# Comparison by Student Classification Demographic

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>All Responses</th>
<th>Image</th>
<th>Current Use</th>
<th>Likely to Use</th>
<th>Mission Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SBTS</td>
<td>U of L</td>
<td>SBTS</td>
<td>U of L</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern Interior</td>
<td>3.149</td>
<td>3.472</td>
<td>3.528</td>
<td>3.693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Exterior</td>
<td>3.262</td>
<td>3.337</td>
<td>3.575</td>
<td>3.363</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Masters Responses</th>
<th>Image</th>
<th>Current Use</th>
<th>Likely to Use</th>
<th>Mission Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SBTS</td>
<td>U of L</td>
<td>SBTS</td>
<td>U of L</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern Exterior</td>
<td>3.131</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.421</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modern Interior</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>3.214</td>
<td>3.325</td>
<td>3.428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Exterior</td>
<td>3.244</td>
<td>3.272</td>
<td>3.565</td>
<td>3.363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional interior</td>
<td>3.279</td>
<td>3.428</td>
<td>3.590</td>
<td>3.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Word Pairs
By Age Demographics

### COMFORTABLE
- Modern 30 & Under: 70%
- Modern 31 & Over: 55%
- Traditional 30 & Under: 59%
- Traditional 31 & Over: 61%

### STUDIOUS
- Modern 30 & Under: 60%
- Modern 31 & Over: 46%
- Traditional 30 & Under: 87%
- Traditional 31 & Over: 86%

### ENERGIZED
- Modern 30 & Under: 52%
- Modern 31 & Over: 78%
- Traditional 30 & Under: 53%
- Traditional 31 & Over: 68%
Phrase to Describe Purpose By Age Demographics

Modern 30 & Under
- Group Study, 23%
- Independent Study, 43%
- Electronic Resources, 7%
- Hard Copy, 20%
- Internet, 7%

Traditional 30 & Under
- Group Study, 21%
- Independent Study, 45%
- Electronic Resources, 3%
- Hard Copy, 28%
- Internet, 2%

Modern 31 & Over
- Group Study, 20%
- Independent Study, 26%
- Electronic Resources, 7%
- Hard Copy, 41%
- Internet, 7%

Traditional 31 & Over
- Group Study, 8%
- Independent Study, 46%
- Electronic Resources, 8%
- Hard Copy, 38%
- Internet, 1%
Qualifications

- UofL: Modern Architecture | Multiple Disciplines | Public
- SBTS: Traditional Architecture | Few Disciplines | Private

- UofL Responses: Under representation of graduate students
- SBTS Responses: Slight over representation of research doctoral students
Qualifications

UofL Exteriors

Ekstrom Library (East Wing)  Ekstrom Library (West Wing)
Qualifications

SBTS Exterior

James P. Boyce Centennial Library
Conclusions

- Validated Jackson/Hahn findings that students would identify traditional/modern architecture as spiritual/secular
- Did not validate Jackson/Hahn findings that students would prefer traditional/spiritual spaces
- UofL students expressed a preference for modern spaces
- SBTS students responded positively toward modern and traditional spaces with a slight preference for a traditional interior
- Students overall expressed a desire for improved spaces – modern or traditional
- Age may influence how students perceive and use library spaces