Georgia State University

ScholarWorks @ Georgia State University

Music Faculty Publications

School of Music

2012

Developing Musical and Educational Identities in University Music Students

Patrick K. Freer

Georgia State University, pfreer@gsu.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/music_facpub

Part of the [Music Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Freer, Patrick K., "Developing Musical and Educational Identities in University Music Students" (2012). *Music Faculty Publications*. 34.

https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/music_facpub/34

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the School of Music at ScholarWorks @ Georgia State University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Music Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks @ Georgia State University. For more information, please contact scholarworks@gsu.edu.

Abstract

The musical and educational identities of music students are often at odds with one another, and yet teaching plays a role in the working lives of almost all musicians. Similar conflicts arise when music education majors view themselves as either musicians or educators, but not as both. This article reports results from parallel studies in two urban universities, one in Australia and the other in the United States. Seventy-two participants contributed drawings and textual responses on three surveys administered across a semester. Surveys were designed to record emerging perceptions of musician and teacher identities. Results indicated that the musical identity presents first, and that it provides a framework for making relevant the pedagogical techniques and theoretical models encountered in education courses and initial fieldwork. The combination of textual and non-textual data provided insights that would not otherwise have been evident, including the suggestion that emerging music teachers construct their identities consistent with the 'possible selves' model of development.

Keywords: Music, possible selves, identity, college students, teacher education, motivation

Developing Musical and Educational Identities in University Music Students

CMUE-2011-0047

Patrick K. Freer and Dawn Bennett

Introduction

The decision to study music at post-secondary level often stems from a passion for music and/or being 'labelled' a successful performer (Sloboda and Howe 1991). Each of these aspects is strongly aligned with music making; however, the simplistic definition of a musician as a performer has little alignment with the careers of most graduates (Bennett 2008). It follows that most higher education music curricula are designed to strengthen a broad range of skills and knowledge in order for graduates to access any number of career options (Burt-Perkins and Lebler 2008). These typically include opportunities to make music through ensemble membership, conducting, studio work, composing and solo performing. They include careers in musicology, history and allied health. They also include a variety of teaching careers in school systems, studios and community settings. The purpose of this study was to explore the metamorphosis of musical identity at various and distinct points along the journey toward complex careers, specifically careers related to music education.

It is often assumed that the process of becoming a teacher begins early, often well before entrance to institutions of higher education (Chong, Ling and Chuan 2011). As such, an emerging teacher identity is similarly assumed within teacher development theories. Such theories do not take into account people who seek to become a teacher because of a lack of other work, or those who attend introductory teaching units as a component of other studies. In reality, individuals strive to become educators due to a variety of reasons; they increasingly come from non-traditional backgrounds, seek teaching as a second career, and are older than the typical

undergraduate student. This research project, therefore, included aspiring music teachers from many backgrounds, ages and career trajectories.

Questions arise about how and when students should begin to examine their preconceptions about the realities of music careers and the integration of both performance and non-performance roles. This is true across employment fields in music, whether based in applied studios, recording studios, rehearsal halls or classrooms. Whilst much of the research concerning music students' identity construction and career development has concerned music performance majors (Mills and Smith 2003; Huhtanen 2008; Ryan 2010), this paper is concerned with identity construction among majors in music education. We begin with a brief discussion of some of the key concepts that underpin our work and then describe the self-reported experiences of two cohorts of music education students in Australia and the United States. In this paper we use the term 'musicianship' to reference the knowledge and skills evidenced in the practice of musical performance, and we examine both musical and pedagogical identities through the possible selves construct that describes how individuals plan toward realising their future personas and achieving their career aspirations (MacIntyre, Schnare and Doucette 2012).

We focus on music education majors in order to examine the impact of formative performance identities on initial teacher training. In the vast majority of cases, several years of technical and foundational performance instruction precedes student entry into post-secondary music education courses. This is logical, for we wish teachers to possess high-level technical skills and musical knowledge. However, the previous focus on performance skills (see Hallam 2002; Hallam and Prince 2003) can create a dilemma for those students who identify primarily as musicians and secondarily (if at all) as educators, and it is further complicated when the intensity of education coursework inhibits the advancement of the practical musicianship with which

students have come to identify. The irony here is that whilst self-definition as a musician is an integral part of professional identity, the time-intensive pathway toward success as a pedagogue and/or school educator can present an enormous barrier to sustaining the musician's performance practice.

This study explored the development of musical identity and its influence on career development in music education. The guiding research question was 'how do pre-service and early career music teachers describe their identities as musicians and as educators?' From the data addressing this question we sought to identify intersections between these two identities, participants' plans to achieve or avoid potential future identities and, consequently, implications for tertiary music education.

Conceptual framework and possible selves

The surveys constructed for this project were grounded in emerging research concerning 'possible selves' (Markus and Nurius 1986), a forward-oriented approach toward identifying both desired and feared conceptions of self. Reviews of possible selves literature (Freer 2010; Packard and Conway 2006) highlight the various research methods used to gather data relative to the future-oriented self-identities of research participants. Structured surveys are the most widely used data-gathering tools (see Markus and Nurius 1986), with narrative techniques and those requesting visual data becoming more common (Bruner 1990; Clandinin 2006; Hollingsworth and Dybdahl 2007; Whitty 2002). Participant drawings and improvised scene acting have also been used within research concerning possible selves (Packard and Conway 2006), including projects in music education settings with adolescent boys (Freer 2009) that led to a curricular model for the identification of possible selves in music, and university teacher preparation

programs (Brand and Dolloff 2002). The latter study compared the musical and pedagogical identities of Chinese and North American methods course participants as depicted in drawings, finding that North American students held rigid, highly compartmentalized images of the distinct identities of musician and teacher, while Chinese students viewed these two identities as more fluid and interactive.

The possible selves framework is grounded in several complementary and enduring theoretical models and research inquiries (Freer 2010). However, where much identity research is focused on antecedents to *present* identity, possible selves is focused on the planning and implementation of strategies toward realisation or avoidance of possible *future* identities. The thinking behind the possible selves framework aligns with established development theories such as that posited by Maehr (1983), who describes two distinct types of goal situations that have opposite effects on participants. These goal situations provide a useful lens through which to look at identity in music.

In the first of Maehr's goal situations, the 'ego situation', competitive activities such as performance competitions and graded examinations lead to external rewards and labels of talent. They also lead to being assigned the 'best' instructors and performance coaches, and being placed into the top ensembles. In the case of music education students, the same ego situations can result in the perception that one belongs to a less able or valued cohort. In contrast, 'task-goal situations' encourage participants to attempt tasks for their intrinsic value and to determine success based upon the realisation or development of personal goals, developed by exploring possible selves and futures. The ways in which students approach their own career and life planning will be impacted by their adoption of one or other of these positions.

Imagining a career

For young musicians, identity formation begins long before university study (Bernard 2005; Smilde 2009) and is a central determinant of self-concept. Music students work diligently to gain acceptance to university music programs, regardless of the course of study. The investment in music over several years leads many students to mythologise about musicians' careers and lives, and it is not surprising that performance is a key component of this. University music students have often been the stellar musicians among their peer group where performance is the product that is visible to, and valued by, music lovers in the community. Within the university environment, where day-to-day contact is with a larger group of skilled performers, 'a questioning of musical knowledge and skill takes place, generated by comparison with new peers in different circumstances' (Pitts 2004, 216). Within this questioning the status of music education courses, and by default, the students within them, comes to the fore.

Performance success, performance-based examinations systems and even the university music program audition reinforce performance identity and labels of giftedness. In reality, teaching often emerges as a secondary, lesser career option when students and parents begin to assess the realities of building a sustainable career in performance. As such, 'the music education degree is often considered a 'back-up' or 'dead-end'' (Roberts 1993, 191). Careers oriented toward education can indeed offer a relatively high level of employment security and financial stability whilst retaining a connection with music and, through work, with the musician identity (Fouad and Bynner 2008). It follows that music education courses can be a logical choice for all students regardless of performance ability, and yet there is an expectation that students with high-level performance skills will want to pursue a performance career. The low status of music education courses is just one component of a strongly hierarchical culture that has a tremendous

impact on the self-esteem of students. Reflecting on her own experience wherein her teaching ambitions were not acknowledged and self-esteem ‘rested almost exclusively in [her] ability to be a ‘successful performer,’’ Ryan (2010, 51) recalls:

A hierarchy developed within me that reflected the hierarchy of the music school and the performer was steadfast on top. Musical and non-musical academic coursework had been drastically reduced and teaching had gradually become a quiet and understated part of my dream, seldom reflected in my daily life.

Identifying with a career

Harré (1984) posits that identity development during university training progresses from a focus on identity that is at first individual then personal, collective then social. The progression toward an outward view of identity incorporates the professional and social affirmation of peers and colleagues within an ever-widening sphere (Slay and Smith 2011). For music performance majors, initial sources of this affirmation are role models such as professional performers and master teachers whose musician identities are underpinned by their performance activities (Hargreaves and Marshall 2003; Huhtanen 2008). Music education majors are also likely to include performers as role models, and if teaching has been a long-held ambition they are likely to include influential teachers as well (Brand and Dolloff 2002).

The mythological representation of artistic life has existed throughout history, with romanticised notions related to genius, isolation and eccentricity (Bain 2005). Early career musicians often hold stereotypical images about artistic life that can impede their development in workplaces that require additional tasks and skills, and the same romanticism can be found among music education majors. Arguing that ‘fantasy and reality strikingly compete throughout the career development of music teachers’, Brand and Dolloff (2002, 28) assert that ‘time needs

to be devoted to enabling students' fantasized music teacher to be demystified' through ongoing opportunities for teaching experience and self-examination.

Young people seeking to transition from higher education into the workplace must be able to integrate knowledge from one situation to another. This is particularly important for graduates who enter professions such as music, which is characterised by careers that feature multiple and shifting roles within a portfolio of work. This protean existence requires a clear sense of self-image and self-efficacy relative to the required professional skill set (Calderhead and Robson 1991). Separate from the tasks associated with professional work are social interactions and political competencies that are equally important yet often unacknowledged. Immediately upon completion of their studies, fledgling music graduates embark on searches for employment that presents complex and changing work environments and responsibilities (Bridgstock 2005), and there is little research concerning the identity development of musicians as they transition to this complex working environment (Greene and Saridakis 2008). The self-identity of musicians can become challenged when the workplace involves teaching, audio engineering, administration, research, or any number of music-related fields that do not explicitly involve performance. As such, professional identity often encompasses multiple identities that are applied according to task (Bain 2005).

In order for multiple identities to co-contribute to an intrinsically satisfying career, musicians need to consider their careers both subjectively (the way in which they see themselves) and objectively (the way in which others see them) (Bennett 2008). This also requires a definition of success that is driven intrinsically rather than hierarchically, and which is likely to be at odds with the dominant culture. Viewed in this way, intrinsic success is achieved when there is concurrence between objective and subjective identities. A creative artist working

as an educator whilst aspiring to a performance career, for example, is likely to have a subjective career as an artist rather than as an academic. Conversely, someone who proactively takes on an academic role and considers academic life to be a positive, ongoing professional activity is likely to have a subjective career identity that concurs with the objective one (Mills and Smith 2003).

A reading of these key concepts suggests the need for individuals to adopt multiple musician identities; however, whilst Bain's (2005) concept of changing identities 'on demand' is attractive in theory, it is likely to prove difficult in practice. In reality it will require a broad and inclusive view of what it is to be a musician. For graduates to redefine the term 'musician' in this way they need to be able to create multiple stories of the self (Ylijoki and Mäntylä 2003) and to imagine and position themselves within each of these stories.

Method

This study was situated in two large urban universities; one was in western Australia and the other in the southeastern United States. Three surveys were administered to 72 music education students during the 2010-2011 academic year. The three surveys, each requiring approximately 40 minutes for completion, were given in weeks 3, 7, and 14 (beginning, midpoint, and conclusion) of both fall and spring semesters; there was no duplication in respondents across semesters or between classes. Only those students who completed all three surveys were included in the analysis since the surveys contained redundancy in order to assure validity and enhance reliability. There were 38 undergraduate and graduate student participants from Australia (mean age of 23), each earning initial teacher certification. The 34 United States participants included 21 undergraduates in their final semester of course work (mean age = 22.0), 6 graduate students earning initial teacher certification (mean age = 38.5), 3 earning a master's

degree (mean age = 27.5), and 4 enrolled in doctoral studies (mean age = 30.5). Participant ages ranged from 20 to 53, and 67% were female.

This was a transcendental phenomenological study (Creswell 2007) involving analytical procedures as described by Moustakas (1994). Moustakas' approach is termed "transcendental" because of key features including emphasis on data as reported by participants, the interpreter's faith in the subject data as legitimate, the setting aside of prejudgements, and the use of systematic procedures for data analysis. Data analysis, in Moustakas' approach, begins with identifying key statements within the data and clustering them into themes and meaningful units. Analysis continues with synthesizing the themes into descriptions of broad phenomenon that can then be combined into composite narratives. To begin the analysis for this study, textual data was transcribed, coded and analysed for emergent themes with the assistance of HyperRESEARCH™ qualitative analysis software. As suggested by Brannen (1992, 73), quasi-quantification was applied to some questions 'as a means of summarizing qualitative material as an alternative to more indeterminate presentations of data.' Visual data were coded and analysed according to procedures employed in recent sociological research involving Participatory Visual Research Methodologies (PVRM) (Chalfen 2011; Mitchell et al. 2011). Participatory visual research involves asking participants to develop visual materials in response to specific prompts directed by the research questions. As described by Bock, Isermann and Kneiper (2011), the multiple possible interpretations potentially afforded to each visual image requires that coding and meaning be firmly established prior to analysis; the interpretive and analytical processes must be distinct. To this end, each researcher independently conducted initial coding, after which coding was compared and refinements applied. Analysis of textual and visual data combined to produce themes and categories from which researchers generated the structural

description contained in this article (Newbury 2011; Pauwels 2011). Graduate students at the United States location replicated the coding process, arriving at an inter-rater agreement level of Kappa = 0.89 with $p < 0.001$.

A pilot study was conducted at the Australian site to refine questions for the surveys. The initial version only included the request to ‘draw yourself as a music teacher five years in the future’. Twenty students (14 female, 6 male) participated in the pilot project, which was implemented as part of a twelve-hour music pedagogy unit. Four of the students were undertaking a music education degree to become classroom music teachers, and the remaining students were performance majors. Some pilot study participants did not produce a drawing at all because, as one individual stated, ‘I couldn’t see teaching in my head.’ Another had difficulty describing her musicianship through a drawing. She instead wrote, ‘I chose not to draw my horn, a baton, music notes floating through the air, scores in my hand. I drew me. All of those things are mere outlets . . . for and by me.’ Based on these responses, the surveys were redesigned to begin with text-based questions and conclude with prompts for the drawing components.

The three surveys were designed to address the guiding research question, ‘how do pre-service and early career music teachers describe their identities as musicians and as educators?’ The surveys combined textual and non-textual (drawing) prompts as a reflection of the predominant data types reported in the literature on possible selves. Questions on the surveys generally progressed from global to specific, with key items (e.g. drawings and narrative prompts about possible selves) repeated in each survey for purposes of triangulation and/or comparison across time. Survey I began with demographic and descriptive questions (e.g. *What are you good at doing in music? What musical activities do you enjoy and why?*); progressed to questions about career expectations (e.g. *What is your number one career goal? Which of your goals do you*

consider not to be achievable, and why?); and then asked participants to rank the importance of workplace values on a semantic differential scale from ‘very’ to ‘not very’ (e.g. level of challenge, friendships at work, time freedom etc.). The survey concluded with the following prompt: ‘Please draw a picture of yourself as a musician and then describe in words what you have drawn.’

Survey II opened with a repeat of some of the descriptive questions from the earlier survey but quickly transitioned to expansion of future-oriented planning (e.g. *What new activities would you like to try outside of music? What have you done so far to progress toward your goal? Are the obstacles to these goals fixed or changeable? What do you need to learn or do to achieve your goal?*). This survey also included questions about role models, including: *Who were your musical role models? Is there a music teacher who inspired you? Have you had a music teacher who was unlike the teacher you hope to become?* The same drawing and writing prompt used in Survey I closed the second survey.

Survey III focused on personal relationships and support structures perceived as necessary to achieve career goals and establish musical identities. Questions included: *Which people have been (or do you expect to be) influential in terms of your music? Think ahead to your life in music; which roles would you like to include and how would you like to spend your time? On Survey one you identified your three most preferred and least preferred values regarding your future workplace; what are they today and why might they have changed?* Participants also completed a chart listing all of their anticipated musical and career activities during a typical week. Final questions included: *What experiences in your own musical instruction made you the musician (or music teacher) that you are today? What kind of musician or music teacher do you hope to become, what kind(s) do you fear becoming, and what kind(s)*

do you think you will become? Survey III closed with the same drawing and writing prompts used in the earlier surveys.

Results and Analysis

Responses to the surveys were broadly characterised by four dispositions toward teaching: hopeful, confident, and doubtful or fearful. These aligned with the three types of possible selves that people envision: positive possible selves that are achievable with effort (hopeful), likely selves that will probably occur (confident), and disconcerting futures—feared selves—that are to be avoided (doubtful or fearful). Participants were concerned with their present skills and how they would impact their success and identity as a music teacher in the future. As Sloboda and Howe (1991) suggested, musical identity seemed of less concern, having been established early in, or prior to, the collegiate experience.

Hopeful (Positive Possible Self)

In the second of the surveys, participants were asked to describe the role models and/or mentors that had inspired a hoped-for future in music and teaching. The role of mentors has been established as a strong predictor of identification with a career in music teaching (Chong, Ling and Chuan 2011). Adriana, a female graduate student seeking to become a certified teacher, spoke about the influential mentors who progressively influenced her identity development as a music teacher:

My decision to become a performer came from listening to another student practicing at the University and being blown away by her skill and artistry. It awakened my desire to grow as a musician. My undergrad percussion teacher encouraged me to pursue performance. My seventh grade general music teacher told me I'd be a great music teacher some day. My high school band director encouraged me to pursue music therapy after seeing me with his handicapped son.

Confident (Likely Possible Self)

One 34-year old male Ph.D. student named Jonathan wrote of his competitive and aspirational view toward ensemble leadership. When Jonathan was asked to list the most important values needed for successful music teaching in high schools, he listed ‘confidence, love of decision-making, love of challenge, and love of competition.’ He added,

I want to be in control of my classroom and my ensemble. I also want my group to be better than others at any festival or competition. I strive to accomplish these in everything I do.

The project had been designed with both drawing and narrative components wherein the text was expected to address ambiguity in the pictures. An unanticipated aspect of this project was that the drawings often addressed ambiguity in the text (where the reverse might be expected). For example, Neil initially drew an instrumental music lesson (Figure 1) and wrote about a studio teaching role. In contrast, his end of unit drawing (Figure 2) was of a classroom setting. Closer reading of his narrative revealed a lack of confidence that he had begun to tackle during peer teaching activities: ‘When I had to give my lessons I realised that for teaching you need confidence. This made me think about classroom teaching’. Cross-referencing the narrative to his career planning materials revealed that Neil had added the words ‘more confidence building’ to his action plan, and to his career plan he had added a reminder about how it might be achieved: ‘Work hard. Study hard and keep motivated by a dream’.

Figure 1: Neil's drawing of a teaching situation in Survey II

Figure 2: Neil's drawing of a teaching situation in Survey III

Doubtful (Feared Possible Self)

Rashid, a 22-year old male undergraduate student, wrote of the balance that involves musical performance and teaching, but also of a life beyond the boundaries of a career (see MacIntyre, Schnare and Doucette 2012). Rashid's quote below reveals doubts that his musical identity can co-exist with his other possible selves. In this sense, Rashid's identity of musician becomes a feared possible self in that it might interfere with the realization of his other non-musical, yet strongly hoped-for selves:

I see myself as a musician but also as a man who has other loves and passions. I can be professional about singing when I want & need to be, but I also have other priorities, like my faith, my wife, and my love of building. Being a musician calls on me to compromise with the things I hold dear, and I will have to put it down someday. Family, faith and buildings are permanent. Musical skill and teaching are ephemeral and vanishing.

The progression of the students' drawings through the course of the project suggested their development of self-identity as a teacher in powerful ways, but in some cases it was the combination of data that revealed the students' thinking about teacher identity. Joanne began the unit with a drawing (Figure 3) that illustrated a happy studio teaching situation typical of undergraduates who have focused on performance skills prior to the onset of pedagogical methods courses (Hallam and Prince 2003). There was no reason to think that she had concerns about teaching; however, in her narrative she revealed considerable doubt about teaching as her future career. Joanne's first drawing and description were typical of other respondents:

Long-term goals – be settling in with a job, whether it has something to do with music or not. I may teach for money reasons, but also I like the instruments I play so it will be good to pass it on to other people.

Figure 3: Joanne's first drawing, in which the teacher-student relationship appears to be as important as instructional content

As Joanne participated in one-on-one peer teaching throughout the project, she found the experience of teaching to be a particular challenge, admitting her doubt with the phrase: 'It's not

as easy as you think it would be'. Towards the end of the unit she seemed willing to reconcile this doubt with her long-held goal of becoming a music teacher:

When I first started pedagogy I wasn't sure if I really wanted to do teaching, but now I'm thinking of it as a possibility. ... I wrote down my thoughts about teaching in my journal and this allowed me to think about it. I could read over it again whenever I needed to.

Finally, Joanne's concluding drawing (Figure 4) illustrates a carefully planned teaching environment but she is no longer present in the drawing. This may indicate continued lack of confidence. Joanne noted her resolve to continue her teacher development and she emphasised the value of experiential learning with the comment: 'The things I need to know more about I have to learn myself by getting myself involved in teaching. I have to get the experience to be able to know more.'

Figure 4: Joanne's final drawing: a structured teaching space in which she is absent

Fearful (Feared Possible Self)

Participants were asked what fears, if any, they held for their futures as musicians and/or teachers. In the case of most participants who chose music education after unsuccessful attempts at performance careers, these descriptions revealed the inverse of Maehr's (1983) 'ego situation,' where positive outcomes follow from repeated successes. Instead, music teaching was seen as a

negative outcome that followed from an unrealized or unattainable performance goal (see Roberts 1993). Some, like George, a graduate student who described himself as having been unsuccessful in his attempt at a solo performance career, commented:

I fear being miserable if I teach at a public school because I won't see the sun. I fear that my life will revolve around and really will solely be 'high school band.' That idea is nauseating. I am not cut up for my life being that. I do not want to live and breathe for just my job and the secure check. I fear if I just have that option, I might give it up and find something else.

George's stated response to the possible realization of a feared self is to simply give up rather than develop a plan for avoiding the undesired situation.

In contrast, the ability to see beyond a perception of potential failure or struggle is a hallmark of the development of a positive possible self – a self which one hopes to achieve. This is related to Maehr's (1983) 'task-goal situation' wherein successes are viewed incrementally yet additively, resulting in a positive outcome across time. Julinda, a 21-year old female undergraduate student, spoke of how her perseverance led her to affirm a teaching future that earlier seemed unapproachable:

The first time we ever did a mini peer teaching in college, I was paralyzed with fear and really struggled to get through the lesson. I almost gave up and sat down, but I made it through, sat down, and immediately started crying. As class continued, I sat there and thought about what else I could do, if I was incapable of being a music teacher. To my surprise, I couldn't think of another single career. It may seem like a negative experience, but it was incredibly affirming. It was a confirmation of my passion – my calling – for music and music teaching.

This semester has been a pivotal time when I felt myself going through a transformation. I am suddenly restless sitting at a desk, learning about teaching. I have still so much to learn, but I feel so very ready to get into a classroom! If you're looking for a pivotal moment, perhaps it was in our teaching demo at an elementary school. For the first time I wasn't nervous. I felt good about my lesson. I taught smoothly and without needing to consult my notes for what to do next: I felt a tiny bit like a real teacher.

Julinda's "transformation" from paralysis to the beginnings of pedagogical confidence was echoed by Connie's journey from disabling fear to empowering anticipation. Connie is a 23-year old graduate teacher certification student with an undergraduate degree in vocal jazz

performance. She commented on the conscious effort needed to achieve success as musician and as teacher:

In the past, I've been crippled by fears and feelings of inadequacy when it comes to music and music teaching. Gradually those thoughts have disappeared as I've gone into schools again and again—I look at where I am and what I am doing and feel confident that this is what is right for me. I cannot wait to begin teaching. The excitement and feeling of readiness helps to alleviate a lot of those fears.

Proximity and Planning

Hoped-For Possible Selves

Research concerning possible selves indicates that the strongest motivational influence is from possible selves that are positive, proximal, and planned (Freer, 2010). In other words, they must appear achievable in a foreseeable timeframe upon the completion of a logical series of actions. Kyle, a 20-year old male undergraduate student, seemed to differentiate between goals for musicianship and teaching as he explored multiple options. He saw his career goals as flexible and attainable:

I would like to earn my masters degree in conducting. Right now, I am not sure about my goal. I am starting to think about other options such as teaching at a private school or college, or performing and building up a private studio and working clinics and such. This would allow me to see the sun and create my own schedule. It would be a lot of work, but again, I could lay my days out as I would like.

When asked how close he felt he was to achieving these goals, Kyle explored the options with specificity and direction:

Let's see . . . a master's degree would take two years and building up my own studio would take a bit of time also. If I try the private school many [school administrators] want someone with experience so that would take a few years also. For studio work, well I would need to keep up on horn and find ensembles to play in and create a chamber group of sorts. I will have to seek out students (through working clinics or really just going into schools). I could start by finding a school I can teach lessons at after school.

Chrystal, a 22-year old undergraduate, related how her goals had changed between administrations of the first and third surveys, noting that she had begun to consider how the

identities as musician and teacher could coexist with the economic demands of adulthood (see Fouad and Bynner 2008). She wrote with specificity about her goals and the students she would one day teach:

My priorities have shifted now that student teaching is less than a month away. I have felt a change in my focus or 'readiness' to teach. I feel excited and motivated to actually do real things in a music classroom on a regular basis. I am especially interested in working with children and adults with autism, and elementary-aged children diagnosed with emotional or behavioral issues. Also, I hope to have a voice/breathing studio and choral program one day.

Chrystal added that she had thought about how she would progressing toward these plans:

It will take approximately 2.5 to 3 years to establish a private studio and about the same or longer to build the choral program. I plan to begin advertising in the spring and through the summer. I will start taking students as early as June. Although, I am willing to take students at any time! I need to learn more about structure and legal matters, such as tax filing and parental paperwork if I have students under the age of 18. I also need to complete development of my website.

Other students voiced their view of the positive possible selves they *hoped* to become. These included, 'I want to be a musician who knows and understands many different styles of music and can create my own or reproduce others. I want to give my students the chance to collaborate and take responsibility for their own musicianship'; and 'I hope I'm the type of musician/music teacher who is sought after by my peers and students of the field of music for private lessons and advice (for music and personal issues) because of my expertise and friendly nature.'

Feared Possible Selves

The possible selves framework holds that individuals develop both positive conceptions of hoped-for future selves as well as negative images of feared future selves. Research about possible selves strongly suggests that these positive or negative potentials become incorporated within identity schemas only when they are well elaborated with specific plans for achieving

hoped-for selves and/or avoiding the realisation of feared selves. For instance, Maria, a master's degree student, first described her positive future self:

I hope to be a music teacher who has good relationships with students and is passionate about music making and who creates an environment where music making is prevalent, valued, meaningful, and enjoyable.

However, Maria also recognised the potential for her fears to become reality. Echoing Ryan's (2010) personal account of how she developed a hierarchical view of musical and teacher identities, Maria related her fears about the possibility for dichotomous roles of teacher and musician:

I don't want to become complacent. I don't want to be too tired or burnt out to create meaningful and enjoyable experiences. I don't want to become dispassionate about music or teaching. I don't want to be 'mean' or stop caring about music or the students.

In her response to a later question, Maria related how planned to avoid realising this potential future self:

I think that keeping myself engaged as a musician will prevent most of this, both outside of teaching as a singer, and in the classroom as I participate actively in the music making whenever possible. Also, using the resources—human, material, and musical—to prevent burnout.

The strategies outlined by Maria were an exception, and related to Harré's (1984) conception of identity growth progressing outward from a personal focus toward a collective, social orientation.

Study participants overall were able to state plans for achieving positive possible selves, but they were largely unable to offer specific steps toward avoiding feared possible selves. One male undergraduate student, Foster, offered an alternative - leaving the profession entirely. Foster stated,

Maybe I could work in other areas if I fail as a teacher and performer. What I'm learning won't be completely wasted. I am becoming used to breaking things down into small

steps and constructing a sequence. I suppose this could be useful in some kind of corporate training or project design. If necessary. I sure hope it's not!

In contrast, many study participants lacked specific plans for avoiding feared selves, simply concurring with Derrik, a graduate student who wrote, 'I do not want to be a boring and incompetent musician or music teacher.'

Allowing Data to See Both Inside and Outside 'the Box'

The drawing prompts were identical in each of the three surveys and requested a depiction of the participants as musicians. However, Survey II included a number of pedagogically oriented questions that appeared to influence participants toward other types of drawings as part of that survey administration. Most participants chose to position their Survey II drawings toward their conceptions of how music teachers function in classrooms, relating a specific moment in their fledgling careers rather than a generalised conception of their teaching. As an example of a typical interaction of the textual and visual data, one undergraduate student, Suzy, exhibited a hierarchical view of teaching both literally and figuratively. Her accompanying narrative comments indicated that she developed her view of teaching from applied studio instructors and from large university lecture courses. Her drawing of a tiered lecture theatre was accompanied by the caption 'my teaching will be at a university level'. In the final drawing of the semester-long project, Suzy presented a view of teaching that reflected openness to the possibility of combining teaching and musicianship in a fluid dynamic. The lecture theatre was replaced with an open space, and in her narrative Suzy explained that the interaction between student and teacher had led her to rethink the role teaching might play in her career.

Participating students were asked to describe in words the drawings they contributed about their self-identities as teachers and musicians. Claudette, a 22-year old female

undergraduate student, drew a simple stick figure of herself at the centre with several objects floating around her. Claudette's narrative description was much more nuanced:

I drew myself singing – my mouth is not open because I wanted to draw myself smiling and happy but I am singing. I drew myself singing with people my own age and with children to show my love of singing with others in choral settings & my love of hearing music with others (and with potential future students). I also drew music going upwards because I think of music as a way to praise. The thought bubble represents the words/poetry/meaning of music, because I like to learn about the meaning of texts and reflect upon or write about what music means. The small heart represents the deep emotional space that music can reach within me. The sun [depicted with multiple rays protruding from the center] represents a lot of things – the joy music brings me, the way music both enlightens and brightens people's spirits, and the universality of music.

Roberta, a 37-year old doctoral student, described her portrait in the first survey in which she drew a stick figure enclosed by a rectangle:

I feel like I am mostly stuck 'inside the box' right now. I can play music off of a printed page, but when the music is taken away I get uncomfortable. I have used my skills on string instruments to pass some on to my students, however because I am inside the box, some of my students are there, too. I try to give them opportunities to explore making sounds with their instruments and therefore some are excited about improvising and composing. Not all students are. There is so much that I do not know about music, and I am particularly interested in music of the African Diaspora currently and its use of creativity & improvisation: African, reggae, blues, jazz, hip-hop, etc.

One question in the final survey asked students to view their initial drawing, draw a current depiction, and describe any changes. Roberta offered,

I am still feeling stuck inside a box of sorts, but after having a 'jam session' with another teacher at my school where I had a chance to improvise and feel free to try anything and make mistakes, I am moving towards stepping farther outside of the box. While music can 'flow' off the page, I think music truly flows when it is performed from the heart and soul of the person, not from the page. There is a whole world of music outside of the box that I do not know much about.

We wondered about the disciplinary 'box' that students may inhabit due to their intense musical training. Just as Roberta commented that she felt 'stuck inside the box' of traditional music forms, students may be confined by the intensity of their focus on the development of practical music skills and knowledge early in their university studies; and yet focussed music study would

not completely explain a singular focus on musicianship. Steve, a 24-year old undergraduate male, incorporated the performer identity within a more holistic and embodied definition of a musician:

A musician is someone who creates music. A true musician, however, is someone who does this and would be lost without it. Music is not a part of their lives in that it is done in evening rehearsals apart from the school day. Rather, it is their lives. It is who they are.

Another participant shared an example of how this conceptual ‘box’ might function in the identity development of university students. Figure 5 shows the drawing of Matthew, a graduate student in art education who was enrolled with the Australian cohort as the only non-music participant. In his drawing, Matthew demonstrates higher levels of drawing expertise. More to the point, he illustrates the difficulty of thinking beyond the disciplinary ‘box’ toward the achievement of multiple goals, potentially resulting in the recognition of manifold identities that are simultaneous and complementary. He includes in his drawing a bag, beside which are the words ‘Always demonstrate high mobility and flexibility.’ Indeed, whilst the ‘box’ may be a confining structure for some students, for others it may serve as a platform from which they may reach for other possible futures.

Figure 5: Matthew's drawing, which illustrates multiple modalities and distinct teacher identities

Considerations and Implications

Results indicate the need to explore identity—self, professional and musician—early in the collegiate years and, possibly, into the early career years. The use of possible selves as a framework for this exploration enables discussion to incorporate *hopeful* and *confident* possible selves alongside *doubtful* and *feared* possible selves, for which our participants were unable to suggest strategies that might assuage their concerns.

Data indicate that strong perceptions of musical self-efficacy are significant in the development of identity. In this study, students who expressed strong orientation toward teaching identities were uniformly those who simultaneously identified themselves as musicians, and yet the reverse was not always the case. Indeed, some students self-identified as emerging music teachers but did not feel that musician was a particularly central component of their identities.

Despite this, every participant indicated the need for high-level musicianship skills when studying education and/or instrumental and vocal pedagogy. For this reason, music teacher identity may be optimally contextualised within a broader musical identity, rather than music being positioned within a dominant teacher identity. It follows that a strong musical identity may be indicative of a successful music teacher identity. This study concerned self-perceived identities and it was not possible to corroborate students' musical identities with their actual level of musicianship. However, if musical success—as identified within academe—is an indicator of musicianship, there may be a positive predictive factor when the identities of musician and teacher are both strong and well grounded in disciplinary skill and knowledge. The reverse may be even more intriguing, wherein students with low musicianship abilities identify strongly with music teaching. A question for future study may be whether students with low(er) levels of musicianship can be successful and confident as music teachers. Depending on the operative definitions employed in such a study, we may gain valuable information about the musical attainments necessary for successful teaching.

An immediate consideration is whether music education majors feel marginalised if they are prevented from studying with the best performance instructors or assigned to lower-level ensembles. In some cases, music education majors receive fewer credits of performance instruction, with practical tuition ceasing altogether when the student begins higher-level music education courses. The reaction to this can be seen when music education students take course overloads or pay extra funds in order to receive performance lessons or coaching that would otherwise disappear from their education.

Results of this study are consistent with existing research concerning the possible selves construct and young adulthood (see Oyserman and James 2011). Older adolescents approaching

adulthood examine their valued social contexts for images of future selves that appear to be possible for 'people like me'. Of central importance in these social contexts are aspirational peers and role models. While self-identification as a musician appears to be associated with students' teaching identities, many higher education institutions design programs in which course work and contact with music education professors only occurs in the second half of the university experience. A future study might further explore the influence of university performance role models and peers in the development of music teacher identity during the years of practical training.

Research concerning possible selves in other fields involving young adults also supports our findings about gendered differences toward self-esteem and self-efficacy (Oyserman and James 2011). Females generally report that higher levels of interpersonal skills correspond positively with perceptions of self-esteem, and they also generally hold that success results from effort, both individually and in groups. However, young adult males are generally oriented toward seeking uniqueness, competence and superiority. Males generally hold that success comes from individual ability rather than effort. In other words, females may not be dissuaded from teaching music if they encounter difficulties early in their pedagogy courses, but males may experience the same difficulties and conclude that their array of hoped-for possible selves no longer includes 'teacher.' Results from this study are consistent with other research suggesting, however, that there may also be cultural or geographic differences in gendered beliefs about self-efficacy, perseverance and identity (Stevensen and Clegg 2012). During the three months of survey administrations, all Australian students in this study, both male and female, indicated increases in their belief that personal success would result from effort, while all male students from the United States indicated that they would leave teaching if success was not immediate

and perceived to be permanent. Future research might explore gendered differences in the development of possible selves among potential music educators, with potential reference to Attribution Theory (Weiner 2000) and gender (see Meece, Glienke and Burg 2006).

One further point of intrigue came from analysing the participants' drawings, because nearly all participants portrayed humans through the use of stick figures (see Figures 1 and 2). In this study we expected students to draw using the same pencil or pen they used for the text-based responses. Research concerning what college students draw when they have multiple utensils, colours and surfaces available to them has found that not all students choose to make use of expanded artistic options even when they are readily accessible (McDonough 2008). However, the results might have been different had we provided more varied drawing utensils, allowed more time for the task, or studied future visual art teachers rather than music students.

This study suggests that the use of multi-modal survey techniques utilising both textual and non-textual elements may provide opportunities for the triangulation of data in projects involving narrative inquiry. These data indicate that the possible selves construct, with its emphasis on how adolescents and young adults construct images of their potential futures, may serve useful purposes within the disciplinary fields of musicianship and music teaching.

References

- Bain, Alison. 2005. Constructing an artistic identity. *Work Employment Society* 19, no. 1: 25-46.
- Bennett, Dawn. 2008. *Understanding the classical music profession: The past, the present, and strategies for the future*. London: Ashgate.
- Bernard, Rhoda. 2005. Making music, making selves: A call for reframing music teacher education. *Action, Criticism and Theory for Music Education* 4, no. 2. Retrieved June 6, 2006, from http://mas.siue.edu/ACT/v4/Bernard4_2.pdf
- Bock, Annekatrin, Holger Isermann, and Thomas Kneiper. 2011. Quantitative content analysis of the visual. In *The SAGE handbook of visual research methods*, ed. Eric Margolis and Luc Pauwels, 265-282. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Brand, Manny, and Lori Dolloff. 2002. Fantasies and other romanticized concepts of music teaching: A cross-cultural study of Chinese and North American music education students' images of music teaching. *International Journal of Music Education* 39, no. 1: 17-30.
- Brannen, Julia, ed. 1992. *Mixing methods: Qualitative and quantitative research*. Aldershot: Avebury.
- Bridgstock, Ruth. 2005. What influences the decision to teach? A quantitative application of the Systems Theory Framework of career development. *Paper presented at the New Researchers for New Times Conference*, Brisbane, Australia.
- Bruner, Jerome. 1990. *Acts of meaning*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Burt-Perkins, Rosie and Don Lebler. 2008, July. Music isn't one island? The balance between depth and breadth for music students in higher education. *Paper presented at the 17th*

International Seminar of the International Society for Music Education Commission for the Education of the Professional Musician Commission, Spilamberto, Italy.

- Calderhead, James, and Maurice Robson. 1991. Images of teaching: Student teachers' early conceptions of classroom practice. *Teaching and Teacher Education* 7, no. 1: 1-8.
- Chalfen, Richard. 2011. Differentiating practices of participatory visual media production. In *The SAGE handbook of visual research methods*, ed. Eric Margolis and Luc Pauwels, 186-200. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Chong, Sylvia, Ee Ling Low, and Kim Chuan Goh. 2011. Emerging professional teacher identity of pre-service teachers. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education* 36(8): 50-64.
- Clandinin, D. Jean. 2006. Narrative inquiry: A methodology for studying lived experience. *Research Studies in Music Education* 27: 44-54.
- Creswell, John W. 2007. *Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among five approaches* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Fouad, Nadya A., and John Bynner. 2008. Work transitions. *American Psychologist* 63(4): 241-251.
- Freer, Patrick K. 2010. Two decades of research on possible selves and the 'missing males' problem in choral music. *International Journal of Music Education* 28, no. 1: 17-30.
- Freer, Patrick K. 2009. 'I'll sing with my buddies' – fostering the possible selves of male choral singers. *International Journal of Music Education* 27, no. 4: 341-355.
- Greene, Francis J., and George Saridakis. 2008. The role of higher education skills and support in graduate self-employment. *Studies in Higher Education* 33, no. 6: 653-672.
- Hallam, Susan. 2002. Musical motivation: Towards a model synthesising the research. *Music Education Research* 4, no. 2: 225-244.

- Hallam, Susan, and Vanessa Prince. 2003. Conceptions of musical ability. *Research Studies in Music Education* 20: 2-22.
- Hargreaves, David J., and Nigel A. Marshall. 2003. Developing identities in music education. *Music Education Research* 5, no. 3: 263-273.
- Harré, Rom. 1984. *Personal being: A theory for individual psychology*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Hollingsworth, Sandra, and Mary Dybdahl. 2007. Talking to learn: The critical role of conversation in narrative inquiry. In *Handbook of narrative inquiry: Mapping a methodology*, ed. D. Jean Clandinin, 146-176. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Huhtanen, Kaija. 2008. Identity work as a tool in constructing professional identity. *Paper presented at the 4th EARLI SIG 14 Learning and Professional Development Conference*, University of Jyväskylä, Finland.
- MacIntyre, Peter, Ben Schnare, and Jesslyn Doucette. 2012. Possible selves as a source of motivation for musicians. *Psychology of Music* 40, no 1: 94-111.
- Maehr, Martin L. 1983. The development of continuing interests in music. Paper presented at the *Ann Arbor Symposium in the Application of Psychology to the Teaching of and Learning of Music*. Reston, VA: MENC.
- Markus, Hazel, and Paula Nurius. 1986. Possible selves. *American Psychologist* 41, no. 9: 954-969.
- McDonough, Kristy Lynn. 2008. Case studies of art therapy as a tool to aid adjustment to college. Masters of Science thesis, Florida State University.
- Meece, Judith L., Beverly Bower Glienke, and Samantha Burg. 2006. Gender and motivation. *Journal of School Psychology* 44, no. 5: 351-373.

- Mills, Janet, and Jan Smith. 2003. Teachers' beliefs about effective instrumental teaching in schools and higher education. *British Journal of Music Education* 20, no. 1: 5-27.
- Mitchell, Claudia, Linda Theron, Jean Stuart, Ann Smith, and Zachariah Campbell. 2011. Drawings as research method. In *Picturing research: Drawing as visual methodology*, ed. Linda Theron, Claudia Mitchell, Ann Smith, and Jean Stuart, 19-36. Rotterdam, The Netherlands: Sense.
- Moustakas, Clark. 1994. *Phenomenological research methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Newbury, Darren. 2011. Making arguments with images: Visual scholarship and academic publishing. In *The SAGE handbook of visual research methods*, ed. Eric Margolis and Luc Pauwels, 651-664. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Oyserman, Daphna, and Leah James. 2011. Possible identities. In *Handbook of identity theory and research*, ed. Seth J. Schwartz, Koen Luyckx, and Vivian L. Vignoles, 117-145. Rotterdam, The Netherlands: Springer.
- Packard, Becky Wai-Ling, and Paul F. Conway. 2006. Methodological choice and its consequences for possible selves research. *Identity: An International Journal of Theory and Research* 6, no. 3: 251-271.
- Pauwels, Luc. 2011. An integrated conceptual framework for visual social research. In *The SAGE handbook of visual research methods*, ed. Eric Margolis and Luc Pauwels, 3-23. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Pitts, Stephanie. 2004. Starting a music degree at university. In *The music practitioner: Research for the music performer, teacher and listener*, ed. Jane W. Davidson, 215-50. London: Ashgate.

- Roberts, Brian. 1993. *I, musician: Towards a model of identity construction and maintenance by music education students as musicians*. St. John's, NL: Memorial University of Newfoundland.
- Ryan, Gina. 2010. Interruptions reshaped into transitions: Personal reflections on the identity challenges of moving to music education. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education* 9, no. 2: 48-59. Retrieved July 14, 2011, from http://act.maydaygroup.org/articles/Ryan9_2.pdf
- Slay, Holly S., and Delmonize A. Smith. 2011. Professional identity construction: Using narrative to understand the negotiation of professional and stigmatized cultural identities. *Human Relations* 64, no. 1: 85-107.
- Sloboda, John, and Michael J. A. Howe. 1991. Biographical precursors of musical excellence: An interview study. *Psychology of Music* 19: 3-21.
- Smilde, Rineke. 2009. *Musicians as lifelong learners: Discography through biography*. Delft: Eburon Academic Publishers.
- Stevenson, Jacqueline, and Sue Clegg. 2012. Who cares? Gender dynamics in the valuing of extra-curricular activities in higher education. *Gender and Education* 24, no. 1: 41-55.
- Weiner, Bernard. 2000. Intrapersonal and interpersonal theories of motivation from an attributional perspective. *Educational Psychology Review* 12, no. 1: 1-14.
- Whitty, Monica. 2002. Possible selves: An exploration of the utility of a narrative approach. *Identity: An International Journal of Theory and Research* 2: 211-228.
- Ylijoki, Oili-Helena, and Hans Mäntylä. 2003. Conflicting time perspectives in academic work. *Time & Society* 12, no. 1: 55-78.