

8-11-2015

# Art Capstone Project: Creating a Rite of Passage for Middle School Students

Jon-Erik Montgomery

Follow this and additional works at: [https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/art\\_design\\_theses](https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/art_design_theses)

---

## Recommended Citation

Montgomery, Jon-Erik, "Art Capstone Project: Creating a Rite of Passage for Middle School Students." Thesis, Georgia State University, 2015.

[https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/art\\_design\\_theses/194](https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/art_design_theses/194)

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Ernest G. Welch School of Art and Design at ScholarWorks @ Georgia State University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Art and Design Theses by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks @ Georgia State University. For more information, please contact [scholarworks@gsu.edu](mailto:scholarworks@gsu.edu).

ART CAPSTONE PROJECT: CREATING A RITE OF PASSAGE FOR MIDDLE SCHOOL  
STUDENTS

by

JON-ERIK MONTGOMERY

Under the Direction of Dr. Melanie Davenport

ABSTRACT

This paper explores various art education models and frameworks as resources informing the creation of an eighth grade project-based capstone unit. I reviewed literature and developed a wish list of desirable elements for implementing a series of lessons with a culminating project-based final lesson. Based on my exploration, I incorporated elements from many of the models including choice-based art education and capstone projects. After creating the Capstone Unit, I reflected upon possible implications and offer suggestions for its future implementation in other art education environments.

INDEX WORDS: Capstone project, Eighth grade, Meaning making, Choice-based, Art  
Education, Lesson Plan

ART CAPSTONE PROJECT: CREATING A RITE OF PASSAGE FOR MIDDLE SCHOOL  
STUDENTS

by

JON-ERIK MONTGOMERY

A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

Master of Art Education

in the College of Arts and Sciences

Georgia State University

2015

Copyright by  
JON-ERIK MONTGOMERY  
2015

ART CAPSTONE PROJECT: CREATING A RITE OF PASSAGE FOR MIDDLE SCHOOL  
STUDENTS

by

JON-ERIK MONTGOMERY

Committee Chair: Melanie Davenport

Committee: Melody Milbrandt

Kevin Hsieh

Electronic Version Approved:

Office of Graduate Studies

College of Arts and Sciences

Georgia State University

December 2015

## **DEDICATION**

This paper is dedicated to my students and teachers, friends and family, and my son Aiden, who is my greatest teacher.

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

I would like to express my gratitude to Dr. Davenport, for her support and contagious optimism. I would also like to thank the additional members of my committee: Dr. M. Milbrandt and Dr. K. Hsieh. Thank you for all your hard work, encouragement, and dedication to art education.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....</b>	<b>v</b>
<b>LIST OF TABLES.....</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Cliff Valley School .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>History of the Art Program.....</b>	<b>4</b>
<i>Student Profile.....</i>	<b>8</b>
<b>Purpose of the Study.....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Definition of Key Terms .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>2 Review of the Literature .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>My Goals.....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>Developmentally Appropriate.....</b>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>TAB.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<b>Eisner, DBAE, and the 7 Visions of Art Education ..</b>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<b>Art for Life.....</b>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<b>Other Inspirations.....</b>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<b>In Summation .....</b>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<b>3 METHODOLOGY .....</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>Procedure.....</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>Data Collection .....</b>	<b>31</b>

Limitations and Delimitations .....	32
Timeline and Intended Outcomes .....	32
<b>4 RESULTS.....</b>	<b>33</b>
Learner-Directed Classrooms.....	33
Exploring Curricular Models .....	36
Assembling the pieces .....	41
Capstone Experience .....	42
Formative and Summative methods of assessing student work .....	43
<i>Assessment vs Evaluation .....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<b>5 DISCUSSION.....</b>	<b>48</b>
Reflection .....	48
Implications .....	51
Looking Forward .....	52
Conclusion .....	53
<b>REFERENCES .....</b>	<b>55</b>
<b>APPENDICES.....</b>	<b>58</b>
Appendix A Sequence of Lessons .....	58
<i>Appendix A.1 Lesson 1.....</i>	<i>58</i>
<i>Appendix A.2 Lesson 2.....</i>	<i>59</i>
<i>Appendix A.3 Lesson 3.....</i>	<i>60</i>

<i>Appendix A.4 Lesson 4</i> .....	61
<b>Appendix B Student Questionnaire</b> .....	63
<b>Appendix C Student Artwork Proposal Format</b> .....	64
<b>Appendix D Exploring Process and Inspiration</b> .....	65
<b>Appendix E Artists and Art Movements</b> .....	66

**LIST OF TABLES**

Table 1 Cliff Valley School Basic Demographic Info. ....	9
Table 2 "Wish List" .....	15
Table 3 Art Education Components From Various Models .....	27
Table 4 List of Themes and Enduring Ideas .....	36
Table 5 List of Themes by Grade .....	8
Table 6 Outline for Capstone Unit .....	42
Table 7 Capstone Unit Rubric Template .....	44
Table 8 Methods of Assessment .....	47

## 1 INTRODUCTION

The pursuit of knowledge has always fascinated me. The opportunity to independently explore an academic area or subject of interest and develop an understanding of content that is relevant to your own life, enhances learning, and imparts meaning has always been my aspiration. As an educator, I live for moments when students come to a realization and discover information that permanently changes their perception, and helps them reach new understandings of their world. To me, art education offers fertile ground for the exploration and creation of experiences that promote learning through discovery.

Liminal space is the period of becoming, in-between your previous self, and your state in the future. In 2013 while enrolled in a Research Methods class as part of my graduate art education program at Georgia State, we explored various models of research in order to develop a foundation of understanding, and to eventually propose and develop our own research in our respective fields of study. One day, possibly while learning what phenomenology was, the instructor introduced the concept of liminality, and it stuck with me. Liminality comes from the latin word “limen,” meaning “a threshold” and is the ambiguity or period of disorientation that occurs during the middle stage of rituals (<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Liminality>, 2015). This period of disorientation, or in-between space in which you are no longer recognized as the person you once were, but not yet the person you will be, has fascinated me. After discovering liminality, I practiced identifying cultural rituals or rights of passage within my family. For tribal cultures, rites-of-passage or rituals that include an element of liminality may be easier to identify, i.e. going on your first hunt, or undergoing scarification or receiving circumcision. For some cultures, a specific area or space of isolation is designated for the person undergoing the

ritual or rite of passage, such as a hut, or house, in which the person will not come out of until they are recognized as a man, or a woman by the community. What about other cultures? What about the U.S.? This period of disorientation, and lack of identity seemed both frightening and fascinating, and I began to mentally list cultural, religious, political, etc. rites of passage. But, with most of these Western rituals, there isn't necessarily a designated space to be "in-between," but the disorientation and ambiguity was still there, just internally. What rites-of-passage, or periods of liminality had I undergone? Was I even aware?

I began recounting memories from adolescence and childhood. Both my stepdad, and dad, while not behaving differently, acknowledged the period in my life when I started growing facial hair. My parents treated me just a little bit differently after receiving my driver's license, and after being hired for my first job. Our conversations became radically different after having my first child. Then I thought about my academic career. I wasn't considered a middle-school student until after I passed fifth grade. I wasn't considered a high school student until after eighth grade. I wasn't a college student until after passing 12 years of school, to undergo another 4 plus years to later be considered a "college graduate".

Then, I began to explore what liminality means to me. In my experience, liminality, at least in most cultural or religious rites of passage, pertains more to the mental and emotional loss of identity, and simultaneously, construction of a new identity. For the summers between middle school and high school, I can remember nervously anticipating the first day of high school, not knowing what was in store, what challenges would await me walking the locker-lined walls of this much larger, and more difficult, educational environment. Or the summer before my first year of undergrad, when fantasies would fill my head, visualizing the esteemed professors, floor-to-ceiling blackboards, and a slight fog that filled all corridors with a sepia-haze reminiscent of a

movie set (my fantasies are anachronistic!). But, while in those moments of not knowing, although I recognized that I wasn't that person yet, I realized I was about to enter this stage of becoming. Who, exactly, I would become, I wasn't sure. I was in a space of liminality.

Now, as a teacher, approaching my fourth year of teaching art, I acknowledge liminality. I see it often. Every year at our school, we hold a graduation ceremony for our eighth grade students. Each eighth grader, near the end of the year, wears their prospective high school's shirt, and the head of the school announces, to audience applause, where each graduating student will be attending high school next year. "They are in it," I think. "They are in the liminal space."

Change is a part of life, and helping students make meaning out of that change can help them to reflect on their lives in a more positive way, and guide their choices in the future. By giving students the opportunity to reflect on their experiences, and develop work based on their interests, I can help students develop the skills to make meaning out of their lives, and perhaps even provide a rite of passage.

### **Cliff Valley School**

I currently work in a private school, Cliff Valley School, in Decatur, Georgia. Other than course-based field experiences, I had no previous teaching experience outside of Cliff Valley. While visiting this school during one of my graduate school courses, I felt I had found my home. In this setting, there is a strong emphasis on school culture and community: The school's mission: "Our aim is to provide outstanding education focused on students' academic and social development in a caring community environment" ([www.cliffvalley.org](http://www.cliffvalley.org), para 1). The entire faculty collaborates toward this mission, to create a strong foundation for student character, academic achievement, and leadership.

Cliff Valley was established in 1966 as a “progressive, cooperative preschool and kindergarten” (<https://www.cliffvalley.org/Page/about-Cliff-Valley/at-a-glance>). Originally located in a church, the school eventually expanded its program and built a new facility in a new location. Shortly after its inception, the school began expanding to include additional grade levels, and in 2004 Cliff Valley built a state-of-the-art 23,000 sq. ft. building. After moving to this new location, the school continued to grow, adding additional grade levels, and expanding the size of the facilities. In 2011, Cliff Valley completed another facilities expansion, “more than doubling the size of our campus to 47,000 square feet” (<https://www.cliffvalley.org/Page/about-Cliff-Valley/at-a-glance>). Cliff Valley continues to grow, staying true to the progressive, cooperative community with a focus on outstanding education. The school is now a 501(c)3 non-profit, includes grades K-8, with two classrooms each for Kindergarten through 4<sup>th</sup> grade, plus a pre-K, 2 and 3 year old program.

**History of the Art Program.** Originally conceived as a Pre-K and Kindergarten program, Cliff Valley’s first implementation of art education was through the use of Artists-in-Residence. Residencies would last a semester or two semesters, but were almost always temporary. This model lasted for approximately 10 years before hiring an artist-in-residence as a full time art teacher. This model of art education worked, but as the school expanded, continuity and progression became priorities. The art instructor during my first visit to Cliff Valley was Kathy Peters, who worked at Cliff Valley for 12 years. Kathy was the first full-time teacher to implement a more traditional model of art education: not focused on a particular medium, but inclusive of a range of styles, media, and artists. While not formally trained as an art educator, Kathy was hired on as an artist-in-residence, and soon became a mainstay. In conversation with Kathy over the phone, she revealed that the school was much smaller when she first started out.

The experience was much more intimate, and it was no problem to have the entire school take a field trip to a local museum. She also reflects on a few different components of her time at Cliff Valley that remain in place today. Providing students with a meaningful, positive experience was of great importance. She encouraged students to explore with a variety of media, introduced artists past and present, and developed lessons around various artists and art styles while connecting to classroom curriculum. She would collaborate with other enrichments and classroom teachers, and would often utilize the outdoor classroom. Frequently, she and the Outdoor Classroom teacher would collaborate on lessons based on overlapping concepts or themes. When asked about formal guidelines, Kathy explained that there were very few constraints, if any. There was no pressure to adhere to National Standards. She explained that the school didn't do that (at the time), while the focus remained on delivering a great experience and engaging with the students.

My first experience with Cliff Valley was during student observations. As a post-baccalaureate art education student I was appointed to different school environments, to observe classroom management, use of space, and to interview the practicing art educator in the pursuit of knowledge. On my arrival, my first impression of the school was the design of the facilities. Standing on 4.8 acres off Clairmont Rd. in Decatur, GA, the school's exterior is strikingly modern, built of overlapping shapes of brick, granite and wood. In fact, the school is "Constructed with Earth-friendly building materials- the first school to earn Southface EarthCraft Light Commercial Certification" (<https://www.cliffvalley.org/Page/about-Cliff-Valley/at-a-glance>, para 7). Surrounding the school are nature trails, a playing field, two playgrounds, a rooftop garden, a life-size chess set, and at the heart of it all, surrounded by the school's architecture is the courtyard garden. Cliff Valley is a trendsetter in its implementation of

environmental education and conservation, as “every classroom has its own dedicated outdoor learning space for planting and exploration. Our building was constructed with a custom-designed, open-air, environmental education classroom for teaching, learning- and getting dirty” (<https://www.cliffvalley.org/page/about-Cliff-valley/programs/Enrichment?siteId=629>, para 5).

The art room likewise has easy access to outdoor spaces and encouragement to utilize them.

The Art room is the first room you encounter as you walk in. The showcase of the lobby, the art room has large glass panels facing the lobby and entryway, on display for students, parents, and visitors. There is a small closet sized room, which houses the kiln. A dry erase board, with an overhead digital projector faces the wall opposite the kiln room. While not the largest classroom in the building, the art room is a decent size, with plenty of room for storage, and large windows facing the outdoor garden.

Most if not all of the instructors carry a smile, students address their teachers by their first names, and there is a level of engagement and excitement that permeates the school. From the first time I set foot in the door, I was instantly enamored. Cliff Valley seemed like a fairy tale. Though not without its challenges, the school is a remarkable example of what can be achieved with proper resources, funding, and a communal effort to provide outstanding education in a nurturing environment.

Each grade level is supervised by three adults: two teachers, and a full-time teaching assistant. Each grade level has approximately 24 students per grade, with K-3 having two classes. The long-term goal is for each grade level to expand to two classes per grade, with approximately 18 students per class. Each class takes part in various enrichment classes, assigned to a specific day and time slot each week. Art receives half the class for each grade level for 45 minutes, once per week. This may be in tandem with another enrichment (Library,

P.E., Music, Outdoor Classroom, Spanish), where one half of the class is with Art, and the other half with Library. This keeps class sizes to between 9-12 students per period. After 45 minutes, the two groups switch, and Art will receive the other half of the class, and so will Library. The structure is optimal for classroom management, providing plenty of time for one on one and differentiated instruction, small grouping, and effective student to teacher ratio. The time allotted works well for the attention span for most students. I would always prefer to have students in Art for longer durations, but 45 minutes allows sufficient time for efficient instruction and production.

The school is structured for student success. Instructors come from a variety of backgrounds, ages, genders, and all bring their individual passion and creativity to cultivate an atmosphere of excellence, where learning is exciting. Every Friday, the entire school assembles in the gym for Friday Assembly. Upcoming and current events are announced, opportunities are given for students and teachers to acknowledge one another, and students present, perform, and share. Friday assemblies are always concluded with the school song. Classroom teachers regularly communicate with enrichment teachers to create a meaningful learning experience, and many of the enrichments collaborate with one another for the same purpose. Parents are an integral part of the Cliff Valley community, with consistent communication, and inclusion in the classrooms and enrichments. Parents volunteer to help out with reading in the classroom, to organize community events such as the Fall Festival, performances, the annual auction, or to take part in activities in enrichment classes. Many of our after-school programs are organized and taught by family members of enrolled children. Nature buddies and lunch buddies pair older and younger students to build relationships across age and grade levels and allows older students to serve as role models and mentors. Cliff Valley takes a child-centered, developmentally

appropriate approach to education with a focus on more than just academics. The school is structured to build leadership, self-esteem, confidence, and nurture a passion for learning through activities and lessons based on differentiated instruction.

***Student Profile.*** Cliff Valley students come from a variety of backgrounds, religions, ethnicities, etc. Each family undergoes an application process and several interviews that include a one on one interview with the head of the school, an in-class visit: in which the student joins his or her potential classroom for a day, and academic review.

Students at Cliff Valley are moderate to exceptional in regards to academic performance. While in general students do well academically, the skills, strengths and challenges for the student population vary. Some students do require additional academic resources, in the form of individual specialists who spend a set amount of time with each student, every week. Also, while students may perform exceptionally well academically, some families choose to enroll their children at Cliff Valley because of the emphasis on social and emotional development. Some students fall on the autistic spectrum, perform well academically, but have short term and long term goals for social and emotional development. Because of the structure of the school, students are able to receive the attention they need.

Most families are from affluent or upper middle class socioeconomic levels. The Cliff Valley community values education, and are deeply invested the school. It is not uncommon for a parent to drop by to assist in art class, read a story, or describe their occupation to the class for Career Day. Parents are also involved in extra-curricular activities such as after school clubs, sports teams, and arts related activities. Our school offers a rotating menu of after school activities, divided into trimesters. A few of our after school activities include: chess club, art clubs for a range of age levels, fencing, robotics, general after care divided by age and grade

level, sports clubs, creative writing, cross country, soccer, ultimate Frisbee, volleyball, and basketball. It must be stated though that the cost of attending the school is not cheap, although there are scholarship options available, this is a private educational institute, with the community of families being highly intelligent, articulate citizens. For example, it is not uncommon to find out that a parent is an accomplished neurosurgeon, or holds an important position in the Centers for Disease Control (CDC). Many parents and families travel internationally abroad during the school and summer breaks. The table below (Table 1.1) is a general breakdown of student demographics and characteristics. Although, it must be noted that the school does not ask for information regarding ethnicity or religious beliefs, nor does it provide that information.

**Table 1 Cliff Valley School Basic Demographic Info.**

Cliff Valley School 2014-2015	
Students	320
Boys	172
Girls	148
% Families receiving Financial Assistance	6

## **Purpose of the Study**

The world of Art encodes hidden languages and cultural enigmas, as well as a plethora of meanings and infinite possibilities. Through art education, students develop the ability to understand this language and create, articulate, and appreciate the world around them in new and profound ways. As a teacher and student, there is much I do not know about successful curriculum integration: what methods and models are successful within a particular environment, and why? What structural features determine whether or not a curriculum is successful? What pedagogical, philosophical, contextual factors do art educators consider when developing their curriculum? What discoveries can I help students uncover to better prepare them for life after 8<sup>th</sup> grade? How can I help students to make their own artistic choices, and support and consider the choices others have made? I have the opportunity to guide student development in art from Kindergarten to 8<sup>th</sup> Grade, and, as a result, have the ability to create foundations of knowledge and experiences for students to reference as they move beyond Cliff Valley School. In this project, I will examine what final culminating experience I might develop to foster students transitioning from 8<sup>th</sup> grade into high school, to help them interpret, integrate, and express all that they have learned, through art. I want to help them understand what art can mean, how art is both infinite and personally relevant, and how it can synthesize learning across subjects, as well as how it can lead to discovery of self, and personal expression.

To me, it seems that researching a variety of curriculum models, frameworks, and approaches can inform the creation of a final project in their 8<sup>th</sup> grade year. This unit will help my students reflect on their time at Cliff Valley in a positive and meaningful way, and better help them adapt and prepare for their transition to high school in a way that will carry them forward with confidence and creativity. In this study, I hope to:

- a) Investigate curriculum development within art education
- b) Examine successful units of study that promote meaningful learning
- c) Develop a curriculum for a final project, in the hope that this culminating, integrative experience will encourage and prepare students as they graduate and transition into high school and beyond.

The practice of art education includes a myriad of strategies, methods, components, that are exponentially influenced by the developmental level of students, school culture, budget, instructor's subject matter knowledge, etc. By the conclusion of this study, I hope to better understand the curriculum design process, and to develop a final lasting experience for our graduating eighth grade students, as well as contribute positively to the educational outcomes of the school as a whole. Throughout this investigation, I intend to document and describe my efforts and emergent understandings, and provide rationale for the choices I make in my sequence of lessons.

### **Definition of Key Terms**

Curriculum: "A series of experiences through which we wish children to go in order to emerge with attitudes, feelings, understandings, skills which we deem it important for them to have" (Morris, 1955, p. 154).

Capstone Project: "A culminating experience in which students are expected to integrate, extend, critique, and apply the knowledge gained" (Wagner, 1993, p.209)

Choice-Based Art Education: Learner-centered practice offering students authentic experiences for artmaking by providing real choices (Douglas, 2009)

Liminality: Defined by Wikipedia as "...liminality (from the Latin word *limen*, meaning "a threshold") is the quality of ambiguity or disorientation that occurs in the middle stage of rituals,

when participants no longer hold their pre-ritual status but have not yet begun the transition to the status they will hold when the ritual is complete”

## 2 REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

In designing a unit for students in their final year at Cliff Valley, there are many things to consider. Should I design a curriculum based on developmental stages (a la Viktor Lowenfeld, 1947), and focus on the zones of proximal development (a la Vygotsky, 1947). Should I begin with National and State Standards for visual arts? Or perhaps transform my classroom into a choice-based setting as in *Teaching for Artistic Behaviors* (2001). As I reflect on my previous three years, I consider my evolving teaching philosophy, and the characteristics of work produced by my students. I notice several patterns based on my instruction and lesson design: no two works of art (produced by the student) look the same for any given lesson. I do not use a template when considering criteria for success, I encourage individual expression, so long as students can demonstrate-- through dialogue, discussion, and product-- the technical and conceptual content delivered during instruction. While these patterns are conducive to the structure of a project in which students mediate between materials, subject matter, and processes, there is still much left to explore in order for me to develop a series of lessons in which students will make their own choices. In this chapter, I share my examination of literature that addresses curriculum design and choice-based art education to inform the creation of a final project.

### **My Goals**

First, let me discuss the goals that I the art teacher would like my students to achieve in their final year. Ultimately, I want students to be well-rounded, to be self-sufficient learners, to understand how to navigate their world, to be conscientious consumers of their visual culture/world. I would like students to know how to talk about and critically examine works of art (describe, analyze, interpret, evaluate) for themselves. Do they like it? Do they dislike it? And why? Can they make justifiable statements based on intelligent observations using the

principles and elements of design as well as conceptual and contextual clues? I want students to understand that knowledge is analogous, and knowledge gained in one discipline can be applied to other areas of learning and life. I would like my students to cultivate a sincere love of learning, of connecting with knowledge and using knowledge to connect with those around them. I want students to understand that in art, as in life, there may be no clear-cut answer, but exploration will likely yield enough information to make a decision, or at least a meaningful experience. I want students to be able to create meaning in their lives, in their work, and derive meaning from the work and lives of others. Sometimes there is no “right” or “wrong,” but only difference. That difference can account for the diversity that makes art and life beautiful, and that beauty is an analog for human diversity.

I want students to know that being technically proficient in art can only take you so far, that being thoughtful, sincere and considerate when making decisions in your artwork can produce fantastic results. I want students to discover that the term “art” is a very broad description of a small part of what art actually is. That the world of art is so vast and broad, and is expanding at such a fast rate that it is relevant to everyone. I want students to use the tools, including how to think, that they take from my class, and apply them to other areas of their life. I want students to expand their notions of what art is. I want students to change their perception of the world around them, and fill them with an insatiable curiosity, and hunger for knowledge. That is my aim. Table 2 is a wish list of desirable components for use in the final unit, designed for students in 8<sup>th</sup> grade.

**Table 2 "Wish List"**

<b>"Wish List" Art Education Components for use in 8<sup>th</sup> grade final unit</b>		
<b>Student Outcomes</b>	<b>Teacher Strategies</b>	<b>Student Processes</b>
Overcome challenges and creative obstacles	Incorporate a variety of processes	Mixed Media
Incorporate personal experiences	One semester (Timeframe)	Critique
Embody knowledge from other areas of study or interest	Fosters academic, social, and emotional development**	Reflecting
Making meaning	Relevant to student interests	Artists at work
Prepare students for High school	Learner-directed	Presentation
Cultivate student ownership & responsibility	Incorporates Art History	Planning
Support peers and share ideas	Developmentally appropriates	Artists at work
Create learning goals	Manageable	Refine work
**Both a student outcome, and a teacher strategy.		

**Developmentally Appropriate.** To create a final unit, I do feel that I must first consider what is developmentally appropriate. That is not to say that students who are less experienced in art are limited to content based on their age or experience, which is not the case. But, by selecting content and designing lessons based on approximate artistic, cognitive, social and emotional capabilities, I can provide students more of an opportunity for meaningful learning and achievement. There are various models regarding art education and developmental levels. The Lowenfeld Model (1947) establishes 6 levels of artistic development. Each level evidenced by stages of visual representation in a student's work. These stages are representative of their understanding of the world, and are not mutually exclusive. A student may progress and regress from one stage to another, and may overlap two or many stages.

Clements and Wachowiak (2010) introduce two influential figures in developmental theory: Piaget and Vygotsky. “Piaget’s psychological theory of intellectual change, constructivism, refers to the self-constructed nature of knowledge. Children are to be seen less as problem solvers and more as problem seekers or raisers” (Clements & Wachowiak, 2010, p. 170). By allowing students to discover for themselves the problems, as well as strategies for working through problems, children actively construct meaning and knowledge. Constructivists not only believe in discovery of knowledge, but personal, subjective meaningful experience through discovery. “For example, constructivist Lev Vygotsky believed that our convictions are formed more strongly by the reasons we discover for ourselves than by those provided by others” (Clements & Wachowiak, 2010, p. 171). Clements and Wachowiak continue to elaborate on the work of Vygotsky, “Piaget and educational psychologist, Lev Vygotsky, believed that teachers should encourage students’ verbal interaction with peers to deepen their thinking about issues” (p. 172). They state that Vygotsky believed that through discourse and verbal interaction, students are better able to develop and defend their convictions and ideas. In constructivist approaches, interaction, active discovery, and construction encourage development within the individual. Eisner elaborates on one of Vygotsky’s more popular theories in *The Arts and Creation of Mind* (2002). Eisner describes Vygotsky’s Zone of Proximal Development, as a matter of timing, where the helper provides scaffolding that balances success and challenge, so that with assistance the student will become capable of doing a task, as opposed to creating a condition in which the child is dependent on the helper.

This process, one that parents around the world have negotiated successfully for millennia, is what Russian psychologist Lev Vygotsky has called the “zone of proximal development.” This zone is the space within which tasks need to be set to be, on the one

hand, challenging and, on the other, capable of being successfully negotiated by the child with a helper, peer, or adult. No challenge, no growth. No success, no growth. Finding the child's zone of proximal development is the way to keep growth growing (Eisner, 2002, p. 73)

Active construction of knowledge, as well as timing and tact will better help me prepare my students to overcome problems independently. Through the development of lessons and experiences that will foster the growth of these skills, I will better help my students to be more well-rounded and independent.

**TAB.** An emerging model of art education, Teaching for Artistic Behavior, or TAB (2001), is an educational movement developed by art educators, inspired by choice-based art classrooms. According to a website devoted to describing both TAB and choice-based art education, choice based art classrooms give students the freedom to choose their materials and explore processes. "If you offer your students choice of materials while providing ample time and space for them to pursue their own ideas most of the time, then you are a choice-based art educator" (<http://teachingforartisticbehavior.org/what-is-tab/>, 2001, para. 4). In *Art Education for the 21st Century*, Douglas and Gaspardi (2010) describe components of TAB and choice-based art classrooms. "Choice-based art education provides both a philosophy and a practical structure for instruction to be given in the context of work chosen by students. Students take on the role of the artist and are challenged to create images and structures that reflect their lives and interests" (Douglas & Gaspardi, 2003, p. 1).

Choice based art education offers ample opportunity for students to make their own choices. Although this model more closely aligns with my aims, there are still many sources of literature for me to explore. So many models exist: Discipline-based Art Education, Choice-

based Art Education, Teaching for Artistic Behaviors, Visual Culture Art Education, etc. I will examine these further below to ascertain what might best fit my particular population.

**Eisner, DBAE, and the 7 Visions of Art Education.** In *The Arts and the Creation of Mind* (2002), Elliot Eisner explores the role the arts play in cognition and development and explores various frameworks for art education that are practiced today. Eisner (2002) asserts “There is no single sacrosanct vision of the aims of arts education” (p.25). Instead he explains that art education, like institutions themselves are influenced by social and environmental factors that determine what educational values are deemed important educationally. “Yet we often assume that the aims to which a field is directed are given by the field itself” (Eisner, 2002, p.25). Eisner describes one of the more influential approaches to art education within the past 40 years, discipline-based art education, or DBAE. Eisner (2002) summarizes the hallmarks of DBAE:

Advocates of DBAE claim that it provides a more comprehensive approach to art education than other approaches, that it addresses the four sorts of things that people do with art: they make it, they appreciate its qualities, they locate its place in culture over time, and they discuss and justify their judgments about its nature, merits, and importance. The four major curricular components of DBAE parallel these activities. (p.27)

Formulated by the J. Paul Getty Trust during the 1980’s, DBAE was and is still highly influential in the field. Eisner (2002) described the key factors behind the philosophical framework of DBAE, as first advanced by Jerome Bruner “through his ideas about the relationship between curriculum and the structure of the disciplines” (p. 27).

These ideas were developed in response to the Soviets' launching of Sputnik I, the first manned spacecraft to circle the Earth, on October 4, 1957. That event prompted the U.S. government to try to improve science and mathematics education in the schools to help our nation catch up. Preparation in the sciences and mathematics seemed crucial to national interests. Bruner's argument that students learn best when they experience a discipline in a form similar to the form of inquiry used by scholars in that discipline appealed to anxious educators seeking to meet new expectations for more rigorous and substantive curricula. (p. 27)

While the same funding wasn't provided for the arts during this period, the general philosophy and logic of curricular development as form following function was adopted from this reform in science and mathematics. Thus, the "roots" of DBAE were starting to emerge.

The result was the development of a conception of arts curricula that examined the arts in terms of their component disciplines. Art educators found these disciplines in the art studio, in art history, in art criticism, and in aesthetics. It was a vision of curriculum that art educators believed would restore substance and rigor to what was broadly perceived to be a "soft" subject. Since the 1990's DBAE has been the dominant model for curriculum development in the visual arts in the United States. This approach owes much not only to Jerome Bruner but also to the work of Manuel Barkan, an important figure in art education in the 1960s and 1970s. (Eisner, 2002, p. 28)

Even more than a decade later, DBAE continue to influence curriculum development in art education. While DBAE is considered by Eisner to be the dominant model for curriculum development, it is by no means the only one. Eisner goes on to list seven vision of art education,

as the aims or goals that direct the choices art educators make. In the next several paragraphs, I describe Eisner's seven "visions" of art education.

Visual culture education refers to education to help promote visual and cultural literacy through the decoding of images and cultural values. "By promoting visual culture I refer to efforts to help students learn how to decode the values and ideas that are embedded in what might be called popular culture as well as what is called the fine arts" (Eisner, 2002, p. 28). Through the language of art, students should be able to navigate and develop a visual literacy in order to promote cultural understanding, political motivation, a sort of sociocultural perspective, or sociocultural anthropology. By understanding the visual language of images, students are better able to understand the values indoctrinated by their culture, and make better-educated decisions, and be informed consumers of their world.

Next, Eisner describes Creative Problem-Solving. Born of the Bauhaus, with a function of design, the creative problem solving approach tasks students with developing "...a clean aesthetic that exploited the natural characteristics of the materials with which the designer worked" (Eisner, 2002, p. 31). In contrast to the more functional Creative Problem solving, Eisner details a very different approach to art education: Creative Self-Expression. Promoted by Viktor Lowenfeld and Sir Herbert Read, creative self-expression was born in response to World War II, which Read and Lowenfeld believed was caused by the inhibition of natural human impulse to create and express, caused by a deficient education system during that time (Eisner, 2002).

Both Read and Lowenfeld believed the arts to be a process that emancipated the spirit and provided an outlet for the creative impulse. For Lowenfeld, the expression of this creative

impulse had not only an education benefit to offer, but a therapeutic one as well. (Eisner, 2002, p. 32)

The fifth vision Eisner describes, is an approach to art education that prepares students for employment in the work force. “If the arts can contribute to success in this realm, it will have something really important to offer. As I said earlier, when there is a social need, people look for way to meet it” (Eisner, 2002, pp. 34, 35). In his sixth vision, Eisner explores a vision of arts education that emphasizes cognition. “Ironically, the arts are often thought to have very little to do with complex forms of thought” (Eisner, 2002, p. 35). In the ever intensifying global economy and competitiveness of our educational system, justifying the arts in terms of cognitive benefits relates back to Eisner’s statement on factors that influence the views: social and environmental factors. But, Eisner states, “...it is a way of thinking about the aims of art education that is still trying to secure a firm foothold in the larger education community” (Eisner, 2002, p. 35). While not a prominent discourse in the aims of art education in an education context, this aim is not without merit. Eisner raises important questions and implications for *The Arts and Cognitive Development*:

What would arts programs look like if they emphasized the cognitive consequences of work in the arts and wanted to exploit such work for educational purposes? In some way such programs would not be very different from the programs that are now available, as long as the orientations I have described were high-quality examples of their species.

(Eisner, 2002, p. 37)

Eisner goes on to state the possibility of developing curriculum for this aim. “There is a host of ways in which curricular tasks could be formed to practice and to assess the development of specific forms of cognition” (Eisner, 2002, p. 37).

Lastly, Eisner summarizes the seventh aim: Using The Arts to Promote Academic Performance. Through justifying the role of arts in enhancing student performance, using arts to promote academic performance is more closely related to the sixth aim in developing cognition. "...Students who enroll in art courses in high school get significantly higher Scholastic Achievement Test scores than students who do not take art courses; the more art courses, the higher the SAT scores" (Eisner, 2002, p. 38). With so much emphasis in our current education system being placed in standardized test scores, and with long term education goals as college placement, using the arts as academic performance boosters seems justifiable. Eisner discusses the implications of such aims:

But can a field make its most important contribution through seeking outcomes that other fields might achieve at least equally well? And, more fundamentally, will the data support the claims made about effects on student performance in academic areas? Will the design of the research support the data? What happens to the reasons for a field's place in the schools if research shows that such claims are overblown, or that evidence to support them is weak, or that other approaches to boosting academic test score are more efficient? (Eisner, 2002, p. 39)

Eisner's exploration of the aims of art education provides a well-rounded foundation of a variety of approaches for the arts. In considering what components I can use in the creation of a final unit, Eisner provides a sampler of several different approaches to consider.

**Art for Life.** *In Art for Life* (2005), Tom Anderson and Melody Milbrandt. Melody provide a framework for art education rooted in DBAE and Visual Culture Art Education (VCAE). Listing three educational aims, Anderson and Milbrandt describe an approach to art education which emphasizes the construction of meaning through depth of learning and through

connections rather than through superficial formalized methods. The educational premise is that teaching and learning should:

1. Make real-world connections.
2. Involve the active construction of knowledge, as opposed to the passive reception of knowledge from authorities
3. Develop intellectual, emotional, skills-based, and expressive knowledge, abilities, and sensibilities.

These educational propositions are interdependent and mutually supporting and reflect a curricular framework called *authentic instruction*. (Anderson & Milbrandt, 2005, p. 7)

Anderson and Milbrandt go on to describe Art for Life as being guided by a comprehensive art education curricular structure.

Although comprehensive art education for life begins with art and the disciplines of art, it expands beyond artistic concerns to the larger visual culture in seeking contextual information about art-centered questions. Through this comprehensive interdisciplinary instructional approach, art for life seeks to understand art and visual culture, to engage in creative expression, and ultimately to achieve the primary purpose of developing real-life skills and meanings through instruction in art. (Anderson & Milbrandt, 2005, p. 9).

Anderson and Milbrandt's Art for Life combines the structure of DBAE, with influences of Lowenfeld and Read's Creative Self-Expression, and Visual Culture Studies. Based on this approach, I believe finding a curricular structure and approach for my students may involve combining several different aims and purposes to suit the social needs and educational environment of the school in which I work.

**Other Inspirations.** Viktor Lowenfeld theorized through empirical observation and investigative patterns evident in children's artwork for five approximate stages of artistic development: Scribble, Preschematic, Schematic, Dawning Realism, Pseudorealism. Other notable figures involved in research on children's artistic development include Jean Piaget, Betty Edwards, and Elliot Eisner. More contemporary figures in art education and developmental research include cognitive psychologist Howard Gardner. *In Art Education and Human Development* (1990), Gardner discusses the findings and implications of research into human development in the context of art education. In his third chapter, Gardner elaborates on research conclusions by notable figures in the field of cognitive development and his own involvement in Project Zero. In particular, Gardner describes the methods by which many researchers use to conduct studies, shortcomings, and future implications for research in the field of cognitive development within the arts. In his account of generalizing developmental understandings in the field of art, Gardner (1990) discusses the pragmatic issues of mimetic approaches to understanding art:

One can perhaps induce the parroting of a response representative of a higher level; but such a response will prove fragile once the particular circumstances of the training have been removed. If one wants to engage an individual's understanding, the most likely route is to involve her deeply over a significant period of time with the symbolic realm in question, to encourage her to interact regularly with individuals who are somewhat (rather than greatly) more sophisticated than she is, and to give her ample opportunity to reflect on her own emerging understanding of the domain. (p. 17)

Gardner's description of depth of immersion over a period of time resembles the aims *Anderson and Milbrandt* (2005) for depth of knowledge, and Eisner described as preparing for

life in the workforce. Other components Gardner describes as effective are reflective practice and involvement with others more sophisticated (instructor or advanced student). Possibilities for either of these components in a curricular context could be the inclusion of a daily journal, one-on-one dialogue and formative assessment with the individual student, and also group critiques and self-evaluation. Gardner goes on to describe more prominent studies within the field of artistic development, with 2 year olds enjoying scribbling, and three and four year olds beginning to show signs of representation. As children draw nearer to the 'age of decision,' they emulate art forms and methods of representation influenced by social factors, including acceptance. "Following the entry to school (and possibly related to it), children of seven or eight continue to draw, but they become increasingly interested in depicting acceptable content in acceptable form" (Rosenblatt and Winner, 1988, cited in Eisner, 1990, p. 18). Gardner continues describing each developmental level with the culmination of the decision, hallmarked by the child's ability to overcome acceptance to achieve a level of expression and personal symbolism within the artwork.

Still, as a general rule, at least in the West, children begin to draw less frequently as they get older. Drawing skill is not much prized and other, more insistent demands come to be made on their time. Those youngsters who continue to draw generally achieve a certain level of technical competence, though it may not approach that reached by even the average Chinese school child. However, at adolescence, a new synthesis may occur: the youth now weds his technical facility to a more personal vision, as artworks become an occasion for expressing—in a symbols system appropriate to the youth—needs, wishes, and anxieties of importance. When this kind of productive union can occur, the youth is likely to feel engaged and to continue artistic pursuits. But when (for whatever technical

or personal reason) such a fusion cannot be realized, the youth is far less likely to remain involved in the arts, at least as a producer. (Gardner, 1990, p. 19)

Gardner goes on to disclaim these findings as exclusive to Western society, and strictly as generalizations. “This picture of artistic development may be less true in other cultures than it is in the West” (Gardner, 1990, p. 19). And overall, the trajectory of art generally gets better as children get older, but again, Gardner refers to the obstacle of middle grades as being encumbering to artistic development. “A number of studies suggest that, in dimensions like originality and flavor, and sometimes even in aptness, young children perform significantly better (and significantly more like adolescents) than do youngsters in middle childhood” (Gardner and Winner, 1982; Ives, Silverman, Kelly, and Gardner, 1981; Torrance, 1986; Winner, Blank, Massey, and Gardner, 1983). (Gardner, 1990, p. 22). This is echoed in Clements & Wachowiak (2010).

Vygotsky writes that adolescence is filled with the tensions between intellect and affect, that is to say, between adolescents’ increasingly self-critical attitudes and the emotional vicissitudes of puberty they are experiencing. Their overly critical attitudes lead many to abandon their creative efforts. (p. 229)

As students draw nearer to the age of decision, experiences where students can create meaning becomes more important. Gardner and Lowenfeld, as well as Clements and Wachowiak all point to the approximate age as being important, if not critical, in the overall perception of the individual as being able to express his or her self through art making. Using my exploration of various models as reference, and considering the developmental and artistic changes occurring near ages 13-15, I hope to develop a sequence of lessons leading to a culminating project for students in transition to high school.

**In Summation.** In my exploration of various art education frameworks and philosophies, I have compiled a table (3) listing each model by name, description, and desirable elements that may be useful during the creation of a final experience. In Table 2, I compiled a wish list of all the components and elements I would like the final unit to address. In chapter 4, I examine each element and philosophy, and use my “wish-list” as a guide for extracting curricular elements. Also in Chapter 4 present an outline for the final unit.

**Table 3 Art Education Components From Various Models**

Name	Description	Desirable Elements
Creative Self Expression	Embraced the idea that art education should be free from adult constraints. Valued inherent expressiveness and emotional intensity of children’s artwork.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Celebrates independence unrestricted self-expression</li> </ul>
DBAE	Discipline-based art education. Characterized by its focus on four disciplines: history, art criticism, aesthetics, and art production.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Art History</li> <li>• Aesthetics</li> <li>• Art Production</li> <li>• Art Criticism</li> </ul>
Comprehensive Arts Education	Evolved from DBAE, focuses on: Art history, art criticism, aesthetics, and art production	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Art History</li> <li>• Aesthetics</li> <li>• Art Production</li> <li>• Art Criticism</li> </ul>
Choice-Based	Learner-centered practice, structured to offer students authentic experiences for art making by providing real choices.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Offer students choices to respond, direct, and explore individual areas of interest. Give students opportunity to incorporate personal interest, and meaning making</li> </ul>
Teaching for Artistic Behavior	Choice-based art education approach, and philosophy of cultivating activities that inform and sustain creative processes. Synonymous with Choice-based art education.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Synonymous with Choice-based.</li> <li>• Often used interchangeably with centers-based, or choice-based art education.</li> </ul>
Interdisciplinary Art Education	An educational approach, and spectrum of learning that connects one subject or discipline to another to emphasize interconnectedness, and relationships among disciplines, cultures, subjects, areas of study (Stockrocki, 2005).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Incorporates embodied knowledge</li> <li>• Incorporates knowledge learned from other subjects</li> </ul>

**Table 3 Art Education Components From Various Models, Cont'd.**

Visual Culture Art Education	“(VCAE) Read and grasp the meanings of expressive visual artifacts and performances in order to succeed in life. Focuses on the artifact or performance within the culture where it was made or used” (Anderson & Milbrandt, 2005)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Connects to other cultures, objects, and focuses on the artifact within the context of the culture in which it was created</li> </ul>
Creative Problem Solving	Art education approach to address problems having social import in technically efficient and aesthetically satisfying ways (Eisner, 2002).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Addresses problems as opportunities</li> <li>• Embraces divergent thinking</li> </ul>
Cognition	“Vision of art education that emphasized its cognitive consequences; work in the arts contributes to the development of complex and subtle forms of thinking” (Eisner, 2002, p. 35).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Advocates for the benefit of art education in the context of intellectual and cognitive development</li> </ul>
Academic Performance	“Aim of art education that justifies the arts in the schools through their contribution to boosting academic performance in the so-called basics” (Eisner, 2002, p. 38).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Advocates for the benefits of art education, in the context of academic performance</li> </ul>
Art for Life	“Art for life, as an approach to art education, emphasizes the construction of meaning through depth of learning and through connections” (Anderson & Milbrandt, 2005, p.7)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Connects to students personal experiences</li> <li>• Provides structure of DBAE, while increasing flexibility to relate to student interests and personal expression</li> </ul>
Constructivism	“Piaget’s psychological theory of intellectual change, constructivism, refers to the self-constructed nature of knowledge. Children are to be seen less as problem solvers and more as problem seekers or raisers” (Clements & Wachowiak, 2010, p. 170).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Places value on learning as the responsibility of the learner</li> <li>• Incorporates personal experiences and interests</li> </ul>

**Table 3 Art Education Components From Various Models, Cont'd.**

Zone of Proximal Development	Concept introduced by Lev Vygotsky, described as "...the space within which tasks need to be set to be, on the one hand, challenging and, on the other, capable of being successfully negotiated by the child with a helper, peer, or adult. No challenge, no growth. No success, no growth. Finding the Child's zone of proximal development is the way the keep growth growing" (Eisner, 2002, p. 73).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Concept can be applied formatively, and as a means of helping students while still maintaining challenge, and cultivating skills necessary to solve problems on their own.</li> <li>• This concept also provides a balance of success and challenge</li> </ul>
Studio Thinking	Study developed the framework called <i>Studio Thinking</i> . Describes two aspects of studio art teaching. Four studio structures, and eight habits of mind.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Identifies 8 ways of thinking</li> <li>• Engage and persist</li> <li>• understanding art worlds</li> <li>• developing craft</li> <li>• envision,</li> <li>• stretch and explore</li> <li>• reflect,</li> <li>• express</li> <li>• observe</li> <li>• Organized by four learning structures</li> <li>• Demonstration-lecture</li> <li>• Students-at-work</li> <li>• Critique</li> <li>• Exhibition</li> <li>• A fifth focuses on management: Studio transition.</li> </ul>

### 3 METHODOLOGY

I was initially drawn to creating to researching this topic after realizing the flexibility and potential for meaningful art education afforded by the structure of the school at Cliff Valley.

While expectations for social interaction, emotional and character development, and academic achievement remain high, the methods and devices used to deliver exceptional experiences are left to the individual teacher, at least for the enrichments. In this chapter, I present my methods for addressing my research questions, which are:

- 1) Which models, frameworks, and approaches would best align with the mission of the school, as well as address National Standards for Visual Arts, and meet the needs and interests of 8th grade students?
- 2) How can I develop a successful unit geared toward the specific needs and learning goals of 8th students at Cliff Valley?
- 3) How might I structure a final project to provide a final meaningful experience for 8th grade students?

#### **Procedure**

Through this study, I explored literature on various art education models, and attempted to find a model of art education to implement for students in the eighth grade year at Cliff Valley. To narrow the type of model or approach I was looking for, I listed and described the goals I have as an educator. I then created a “wish list,” of elements I felt reflected my educational goals. After exploring structure for an 8<sup>th</sup> grade culminating unit that best suits the needs of the students within the philosophy of the school. I continue my research into various

models of art education curriculum as I continue to develop these ideas. I researched and developed an outline for a project-based unit of study that supports my aim.

I intend to identify themes, approaches, and models from across disciplines that touch on these topics, derive implications and design a sequence of lessons that culminate with a final lesson for 8<sup>th</sup> grade that incorporates previously covered content, is relevant to student interests, and gives students the freedom to propose and produce their own personal artwork.

### **Data Collection**

To answer the first research question, I created a “wish list” of desirable elements I feel also align with the mission of the school. Next, I reviewed current and previous research and literature on art education models, frameworks, and approaches. Conversations with the previous art teacher (Kathy Peters), and my personal reflection and experience also serve as sources of data. Next, I categorized each model based on defining characteristics, and elements I found desirable to implement in my own classroom. By comparing the exploration of models table with my “wish list,” I determined what models of art education best support my aims, either for use in implementing in the classroom, or to serve as an element in the development of a modified structure for implementation in the classroom. Each model I reviewed, as a prerequisite, adheres to National Standards for Visual Arts.

To answer the second and third questions, I referred to my previous tables and incorporated elements I found to be desirable. The challenge came in determining what specific needs and learning goals my 8<sup>th</sup> grade students may have. After reviewing literature on choice-based art education frameworks, I concluded that further research was needed. Expanding my scope to secondary and post-secondary educational models and frameworks led me to a discovery that changed the direction of the project. Next, I incorporated elements from several

different models, frameworks, and approaches to create a final unit. This will be explained in further detail later in chapter 4.

### **Limitations and Delimitations**

The unit I proposed is specific to my school. It will align with the mission of the school (school's philosophy), and will depend heavily on the choices made by each individual student, with my guidance oversight. Limitations include the number of students in the graduating grade (grade 8), within the timeline of the final school semester. Also, as this is an independently directed project, it should be noted that the processes, size, and materials need be manageable. I am focusing on the 8th grade in more detail because of the significance of the age group, developmental level, and artistic experience, and because of the relationship between the students and me, as well as their impending graduation.

### **Timeline and Intended Outcomes**

I intend to complete this project by August 1, 2015. I intend to implement the project during the school year, following completion of this project. This will involve further research into topics that integrate students personal interests, including: choice-based art education, assessment, and meaning making. Ultimately, I developed an outline of themes for exploration intended for grades K-7. I also developed a unit outline of four lessons. In the next chapter, I present my findings, as well as describe the process of creation. In chapter 5, I reflect on what I did, and what I learned.

## 4 RESULTS

In this chapter, I present answers to my research questions. I begin by describing the process of creating the final unit. I review the relationship between my literature review and how it contributed to the final unit. I also present research that supports choices made within the capstone unit. Finally, I present an outline for a unit of lessons developed for my students in their 8<sup>th</sup> grade year at Cliff Valley.

### **Learner-Directed Classrooms**

In teaching art, the challenge for me is achieving balance in designing lessons that are challenging to students, while also providing independence in the choices students make within their work, and being flexible in meeting a variety of interests. This in many ways reflects the same challenges other art teachers face, especially those who implement choice-based practices in their classrooms. In *Supporting Young Artists as Independent Creators*, (2012) Tannis Longmore describes his experience as an art specialist in a public elementary school, as his curriculum evolves from a more traditional approach to art education, to implementing choice-based learning. "...I felt that our work together was missing the *it* of art" (Longmore, 2012, p.57). While Longmore was structuring lessons in a sequential manner, and referencing artists from history and around the world, in an effort to support children's creative growth in a developmentally appropriate manner, he felt that his students were not "truly connecting with the work( p.57)". Longmore felt as though the structure of experiences developed by an adult, with predetermined artistic products that should be recognizable by adults hindered the students' innate ability to create for themselves.

If the main work of artists is to not follow directions to reach predetermined outcomes, then is it a legitimate way for beginning artists to spend their time? At best, it wastes children's time. Worse, it may foster dependency and lead to resentment, power struggles, and an erosion of the relationship between the adult and child. (Longmore, 2012, p. 58)

Longmore argues that the underlying message of a curriculum where the teacher makes choices in student artwork can undermine the goal of the educator.

Worst of all would be if these activities superseded the children's natural creative drive, making them feel their own efforts were lacking and not worth doing. A hidden curriculum opposite of the teacher's intention emerges when all, or most, artistic and aesthetic direction comes from the teacher. In this unintended curriculum, creativity belongs to the teacher (Longmore, 2012, p. 58)

Throughout the process of designing curriculum for art, this is a challenge I face. Often students will ask if their work looks good, to which I reply: "How do you feel about it?" I am concerned that students desire artistic approval rather than meaningful creation. While guiding students either in direct conversation in response to their artwork, or in small or large group setting, I try and help students develop a sense of responsibility and respect for their work, and dissuade students to achieve work that "looks good." My goal is to reward effort and patience, and not necessarily the product. Reward the work and effort, and not completion.

The same challenges and frustrations that Longmore faced when implementing a more traditional approach to curriculum, reflect my own. "Children's art must be about children's ideas" (Longmore, 2012, p. 59). By allowing children the freedom to create, and providing a safe space and materials, as well as consistency, children are better able to express their ideas and

explore. They are more willing to take risks, and explore ideas further if they develop confidence and trust.

Longmore's reflection validates my decision to help students help themselves by giving students the freedom to make their own choices in their work. In reflecting on my own experiences, I feel that students yearn to create and solve problems independently. While my lesson design often takes this into account, I believe students would not only excel, but also gain profound meaning and insight into themselves, the artistic process, and their experience in school through the creation of works of art based on their interests, using media they choose, with a process they develop. In designing a unit of lessons for 8th grade, I implemented choice-based components, as they share structural components that encourage student independence and problem solving. I made this choice in the hopes that by allowing students to direct their own artwork and subject of interest, they would become more invested and engaged with their creation, and as a result, the experience would become more meaningful to them.

Outside of the realm of art education, having students propose, direct, and self-mediate their own work and process plays a large role in nearly every field of study, line of work, and touches on higher-order thinking skills. I am interested in ways to bring students experiences outside of the art room into a final studio project where students select their process, materials, and content, in a way that allows them to make meaning out of their experience at school, and life, that will guide them beyond their time at Cliff Valley, and lead to great insight into themselves and the world around them.

For implementing the unit of lessons for 8th grade, in which the students will have a great deal of creative freedom, researching the challenges choice based teachers face has helped me in designing and anticipating challenges students may face in directing, producing, and reflecting

on their artwork and process. After researching and developing lessons, there are still many challenges and obstacles to consider for further implementation. Next, I describe the process of creation, in both the unit of lessons for 8<sup>th</sup> grade students, as well as the outline of themes and topics for K-7.

### Exploring Curricular Models

By creating a curricular foundation of universal themes for students to explore, avoids exclusivity by focusing on ideas that exceed one specific discipline. Another advantage of creating a curricular foundation using themes, is that students can connect these to personal experience, and incorporate knowledge of a particular theme or idea from other academic areas

**Table 4 List of Themes and Enduring Ideas**

Foundations for curriculum development				
Emotions/Feelings	Food	Power	Family	Social Power
Imagination	Identity	Heroes	Change	My city
Communication	Nature	Love	Social Power	Personal Experiences
Diversity	Expression	Dreams & Fantasy	Fear	Social Conflict
Masculinity	Imagination	Femenism	Community	Relationships

In my exploration of curriculum development, selecting universal themes or enduring ideas was one strategy shared by many of the literature sources reviewed. In Table 4, a list of themes generated from my review of literature is presented. “Enduring ideas are similar to themes, topics, or issues that reflect big questions about the human experience” (Stewart & Walker, 2005, p. 25). Enduring ideas can help students build connections, and strengthen the potential for depth of learning, through multiple means of exploration and inquiry. Table 5 is an example list of themes by grade, including essential questions, possible media to introduce and build upon, and processes appropriate for each grade. The following themes were chosen in order to build technical skills, and provide a foundation of exploratory processes. Broad themes

and enduring ideas transcend specific disciplines, and can be modified to fit student understanding and developmental level. Experiences and reports from elementary teachers implementing enduring ideas as curriculum foundations suggest that incorporating enduring ideas to younger students is a matter of making abstract concepts accessible (Stewart & Walker, 2005). Themes can be made accessible by introducing them in a context that students are already familiar with, or relating to students existing body of knowledge.

My experience with the students at Cliff Valley, and research influenced the sequence of skills and processes. Incorporating a variety of processes, themes, and media provides a well-rounded educational foundation, but also exposes students to different methods for exploring themes of their own. I feel that these themes build upon previous lessons and skills and provide a context for what I would want them to do in 8<sup>th</sup> grade.

**Table 5 List of Themes by Grade**

Gr.	Theme	E.Q.	Media	Process
K	Elements of Art & Imagination	<p>What are the elements of art?</p> <p>What is imagination?</p> <p>How can imagination be used to create works of art?</p> <p>How do artists use imagination?</p>	<p>Pencil</p> <p>Marker</p> <p>Colored Pencil</p> <p>Sharpie</p> <p>Finger-paint</p> <p>Clay</p> <p>Paper-Mache</p> <p>Tempera Paint</p> <p>Finger Paint</p>	<p>Printmaking</p> <p>Drawing</p> <p>Painting</p> <p>Hand building</p> <p>Collaboration</p> <p>Presentation</p>
1	Imagination	<p>How do artists come up with ideas?</p> <p>What is imagination?</p> <p>How can imagination be used to create works of art?</p> <p>How do artists use imagination?</p>	<p>Pencil</p> <p>Marker</p> <p>Colored Pencil</p> <p>Sharpie</p> <p>Finger-paint</p> <p>Clay</p> <p>Tempera Paint</p>	<p>Drawing</p> <p>Painting</p> <p>Handbuilding</p> <p>Cutting</p> <p>Collage</p> <p>Collaboration</p> <p>Drawing from observation</p> <p>Painting from observation</p> <p>Group Presentation</p> <p>Solo Presentation</p>
2	Reality & Fantasy	<p>What is realistic?</p> <p>What is fantasy?</p> <p>How do artists explore reality and fantasy?</p> <p>How do other cultures use reality and fantasy?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pencil</li> <li>• Marker</li> <li>• Colored Pencil</li> <li>• Sharpie</li> <li>• Finger-paint</li> <li>• Clay</li> <li>• Tempera Paint</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Drawing</li> <li>• Painting</li> <li>• Hand building</li> <li>• Collage</li> <li>• Cutting</li> <li>• Assembling</li> <li>• Printmaking</li> <li>• Painting from observation</li> <li>• Drawing from observation</li> <li>• Group/solo presentation</li> </ul>

**Table 5 List of Themes by Grade, Cont'd.**

3	The Artist	<p>What is an artist?</p> <p>What do artists do? Has the definition of an artist changed over time?</p> <p>What does art in other cultures look like?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Clay</li> <li>• Plaster</li> <li>• Found objects</li> <li>• Paper-Mache</li> <li>• Temepera Paint</li> <li>• Acrylic Paint</li> <li>• Oil Pastel</li> <li>• Crayon</li> <li>• Colored Pencil</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Drawing</li> <li>• Painting</li> <li>• Handbuilding</li> <li>• Collage</li> <li>• Drawing from observation</li> <li>• Painting from observation</li> <li>• Found-object assemblage</li> <li>• Collaborative artwork</li> <li>• Group/solo presentation</li> </ul>
4	Self & Identity	<p>What makes up your identity?</p> <p>How have artists explored self &amp; identity through works of art?</p> <p>How have artists portrayed themselves throughout history?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Colored Pencil</li> <li>• Sharpie</li> <li>• Marker</li> <li>• Crayon</li> <li>• Oil Pastel</li> <li>• Acrylic Paint</li> <li>• Tempera Paint</li> <li>• Natural Objects</li> <li>• Found objects</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Handbuilding</li> <li>• Collage</li> <li>• Drawing from observation</li> <li>• Painting from observation</li> <li>• Found-object assemblage</li> <li>• Collaborative Artwork</li> <li>• Writing about the work of others</li> <li>• Writing about your own artwork</li> <li>• Researching the work of others</li> <li>• Group/solo presentation</li> </ul>
5	Values	<p>What can art tell us about other cultures and periods in time?</p> <p>What is important to me?</p> <p>What are my values?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pencil</li> <li>• Drawing Pencil</li> <li>• Oil Pastel</li> <li>• Chalk Pastel</li> <li>• Acrylic Paint</li> <li>• Tempera Paint</li> <li>• Watercolor</li> <li>• Sharpie</li> <li>• Marker</li> <li>• Found objects</li> <li>• Natural Objects</li> <li>• Wire</li> <li>• Paper Mache</li> <li>• Plaster</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Drawing from observation</li> <li>• Painting from observation</li> <li>• Collage</li> <li>• Handbuilding</li> <li>• Printmaking</li> <li>• Collaborative Artwork</li> <li>• Found-object</li> <li>• Group/solo presentation assemblage</li> <li>• Writing about the work of others</li> <li>• Writing about your own artwork</li> <li>• Researching the work of others</li> </ul>

**Table 5 List of Themes by Grade, Cont'd.**

6	Identity	<p>What is a portrait?</p> <p>What is an identity?</p> <p>What makes up your identity?</p> <p>Can your identity change over time?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pencil</li> <li>• Drawing Pencil</li> <li>• Oil Pastel</li> <li>• Chalk Pastel</li> <li>• Acrylic Paint</li> <li>• Tempera Paint</li> <li>• Watercolor</li> <li>• Sharpie</li> <li>• Marker</li> <li>• Found objects</li> <li>• Natural Objects</li> <li>• Wire</li> <li>• Paper Mache</li> <li>• Plaster</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Drawing from observation</li> <li>• Painting</li> <li>• Collage</li> <li>• Assemblage</li> <li>• Art Criticism</li> <li>• Writing about the work of others</li> <li>• Writing about your own work</li> <li>• Researching the work of others</li> <li>• Group/solo presentation</li> </ul>
7	Social Power Social Responsibility	<p>What is social power?</p> <p>What is social responsibility?</p> <p>Do artists have a responsibility to society?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Digital media</li> <li>• Oil Pastel</li> <li>• Chalk Pastel</li> <li>• Acrylic Paint</li> <li>• Tempera Paint</li> <li>• Watercolor</li> <li>• Sharpie</li> <li>• Marker</li> <li>• Found Objects</li> <li>• Natural Objects</li> <li>• Wire</li> <li>• Paper Mache</li> <li>• Plaster</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Maskmaking</li> <li>• Drawing</li> <li>• Painting</li> <li>• Handbuilding</li> <li>• Collage</li> <li>• Assemblage</li> <li>• Photography</li> <li>• Digital Arts</li> <li>• Art Criticism</li> <li>• Assemblage</li> <li>• Writing about the work of others</li> <li>• Writing about your own work</li> <li>• Group/solo presentation</li> <li>• Researching the work of others</li> </ul>

Based on my review of the literature, there were many useful elements from each model. Although, there wasn't one specific model or approach that satisfied all of the elements I would like to incorporate in the final experience. There were some very useful elements from a few sources, though. Choice-based art education more closely resembled the types of experiences I

want my students to have. Like many of the units and lessons in my current curriculum, my final experience would need to be modified elements from a variety of sources, put together in a cohesive, cogent sequence. Table 5 is an example of an outline of enduring ideas or themes for exploration that would contribute to development of student's skills in grade K-7.

**Assembling the pieces.** While some students may relish the opportunity for independent exploration and personal expression, other students may become overwhelmed. After my review of literature lead me to explore choice-based models of art education, I began looking at literature on secondary art education, and post-secondary education. I knew I wanted the freedom and independence of choice-based models, while emphasizing artistic behaviors a la TAB, but I still lacked the structure. I couldn't completely change the structure of the class and expect students to adapt within a year's time, so I began exploring post-secondary and secondary education models as well. Then, I stumbled upon *Capstone* projects, which various institutions implement as a final means for students to incorporate embodied knowledge in either a written thesis or project similar to a rite of passage.

While the examples of individual capstone projects that I found were not applicable, the framework of a capstone project aligned with most of my wish list of desirable elements. This discovery influenced the direction of the project. Using the capstone project as a framework to build upon, I began developing lessons to build skills to help students become independent explorers of their personal interests. This modified structure, presented below (Table 5, and in detail in Appendix A) accommodates a range of student's needs and learning goals, and more similarly resembles choice-based models of art education, but with modified elements.

**Table 6 Outline for Capstone Unit**

Outline for Capstone Unit			
Lesson #	Theme	Activity	Description
Lesson 1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Generating ideas</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Themes vs Issues</li> <li>Opinions vs beliefs</li> <li>Researching the process of other artists</li> </ul>	See Appendix A.1
Lesson 2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Writing a Proposal</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Exploring media, process and number of works</li> </ul>	See Appendix A.2
Lesson 3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Studio Time</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Group Critique</li> <li>Studio working time</li> </ul>	See Appendix A.3
Lesson 4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Writing an Artist Statement</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Peer Review, Self-Assessment</li> </ul>	See Appendix A.4

### Capstone Experience

By creating an authentic final experience in the form of a unit in which students propose and direct their own artistic experience (under my guidance), I have the opportunity help students to prepare for their change in academic environment, to make meaning of their transition from middle grades to high school, and to encourage positive self-reflection. My hope is that students will have the opportunity to independently explore areas of artistic interest, create work that is meaningful, and incorporate embodied knowledge gained from their personal lives and education, and translate this into works of art. This is commonly referred to in post-secondary education as a “Capstone Course.” Wagenaar (1993) offers a description of what constitutes a capstone course, and what questions students should address in their study

The capstone-course revisits these basics; it asks students to interconnect them, to assess which aspects really are the most basic, to compare the basic questions in sociology with the basic questions in other disciplines, to state how their exposure to sociology has affected their values and their views of life, to explicitly link knowledge gained from one

sociology course with that gained in another, and to participate competently in a discussion of the basic arguments in the field.(Wagenaar, 1993, p. 211)

While Wagenaar situates his discussion within the realm of Sociology, his description of interconnectedness, and self-reflection of values through student-driven exploration and inquiry are exactly the kinds of experiences I want to leave with my students as they graduate. By creating a project based capstone unit that incorporates interdisciplinary themes/topics, as well as studio production and artistic processes, I hope that I will help my students leave school with a memorable learning experience that will stay with them as they transition to other settings.

### **Formative and Summative methods of assessing student work**

With any educational outcome, assessment is crucial. In creating an open-ended, student-directed project, one must consider various methods of assessment, and what methods are appropriate. In *Grading Student Artwork: A Plan for Effective Assessment* (1990), Carole Henry discusses the importance of assessment, and being direct with students about educational objectives. “Teachers in all subject areas and at all grade levels are expected to account for student progress. Art is no exception” (Henry, 1990, p. 61). Specifically for art educators, the element of subjectivity in artwork can be an obstacle in both assessment and evaluation. “The assignment of a letter grade to a seemingly subjective work, no matter how carefully thought-out the grade, can appear to be arbitrary to some students” (Henry, 1990, p 62). Henry states that the key to effective assessment is being clear with students on what objectives will be measured or assessed. “Assignments must have clear, well-defined objectives which can be measured” (Henry, 1990, p. 63). Henry presents logical points in her article. Presenting students with clear, understandable objectives seems only fair. For product-based lessons, this seems simple enough. But, with a project in which students determine their subject, medium, and process, subjectivity

becomes an even larger element. With so many variables to consider, I developed a modified assessment plan was developed. The rubric below is on tool I will utilize to provide feedback to my students.

**Table 7 Capstone Unit Rubric Template**

Rubric Template for 8 <sup>th</sup> grade Capstone Unit				
Item	Below Grade Level	Needs Improvement	Progressing Well	Excelling
Artist Statement	Artist statement does not inform reader of artists intention. Statement does not relate to artwork in a clear, logical manner. Statement contains many grammatical and spelling errors. Statement does not mention media, inspiration, or artistic process. Statement needs further revision.	Artist statement relates to artwork. Artist statement does not inform reader of the artistic process well. Statement has few spelling and grammatical errors.	Artist statement informs the reader of the artists intention. Informs reader of ideas, inspiration, and artistic processes (including medium). Statement has few spelling and grammatical errors, if any.	Artist statement informs reader of the artists intention. Informs reader of ideas, inspirations, and the artistic process (including medium). Relates to artwork, in a clear and logical manner. Statement has been revised for grammar and spelling, with not spelling or grammatical errors. Student went above and beyond in linking work to other fields of study, or other artists who inspired student to create work.

**Table 7 Capstone Unit Rubric Template Cont'd.**

Proposal	Student did not fully complete the proposal by answering all of the worksheet questions	Student answered some of the proposal questions. Idea needs further research or planning	Student answered all of the proposal questions. Student has provides thorough explanation of ideas	Student answers all of the proposal questions. Students has provided thorough explanation of ideas. Student went above and beyond by providing research related to field of exploration or idea.
Group Critique	Student does not use appropriate vocabulary, student participation is minimal during critique.	Student uses appropriate vocabulary during critique. Student participating is minimal during critique	Student uses appropriate vocabulary during critique. Student looks for opportunities to give insightful, considerate suggestions.	Student uses appropriate vocabulary during critique. Student looks for opportunities to give insightful, considerate suggestions. Student goes above and beyond during critiques to participate at every opportunity.
Artwork	Artwork does not relate to original proposal. Student ignores feedback gained from critique to formatively assess progress and make changes as necessary.	Artwork relates to original proposal. Student does little to apply feedback gained from critique to formatively assess progress and make changes as necessary.	Artwork relates to original proposal. Student applies feedback gained from critique to formatively assess progress and make changes as necessary.	Artwork relates to original proposal. Student applies feedback gained from critique to formatively assess progress and make changes as necessary. Student goes above and beyond during production, to look for areas of improvement, or to add additional effort.
Sketch-book & Journal	Student is missing 3 or more daily entries in sketchbook. Student written goals for each day are not clear. Student does not reflect on progress for each day.	Student is missing daily entries in sketchbook. Written goals are not clear for each day. Student reflects minimally on progress.	Student completed goals and reflections for each day of working. Student does well at reflecting on progress.	Student completed goals and reflections for each day of working. Student does well at reflecting on progress and short term and long term goals. Student goes above and beyond in reflections to provide meaningful insight and strategies for reaching goals

**Table 7 Capstone Unit Rubric Template Cont'd.**

Effort Crafts- manship	Student is not consistent in putting forth effort, or puts forth minimal effort. When working, student needs frequent reminders to stay on task. Student talks frequently and distracts others during studio time. Student does not go back to address items for improvement.	Student is somewhat consistent in putting forth effort. When working, student needs reminders to stay on task. Student talks frequently during studio time. Some items throughout unit need more work. Student does not go back and address items for improvement.	Student consistently puts forth their best effort in each class. Student stays focused during studio time.	Student consistently puts forth their best effort in each class. Student stays focused during studio time. Student goes above and beyond in looking for ways to improve their work.
Process Presentation	Student detailed few characteristics from time period, artist, and processes. Student was not thorough, and did not complete all of the questions from the worksheet.	Student mostly detailed the time period, artist, processes and inspirations for the artist. Student was not thorough, and did not complete all of the questions from worksheet.	Student detailed the time period, artist, processes, and inspirations for the artist. Student presented each question from worksheet.	Student detailed the time period, artist, processes and inspirations for the artist. Student went above and beyond, in thoroughly exploring and presenting each question from worksheet.

***Assessment vs Evaluation.*** In order to appropriately assess student progress, and determine success, I need to clearly understand what assessment is, and what evaluation is. After a brief search, I found that assessment and evaluation are different, but have much in common.

Assessment focuses on specific learning and teaching outcomes, while evaluation determines grades and may incorporate cooperation, discussion, organization, etc.

(<http://arc.duke.edu/documents/The%20difference%20between%20assessment%20and%20evaluation.pdf>, para. 2 and 3). In short, evaluation cannot take place without assessment. There are also various types of assessment: diagnostic, formative, and summative

([http://www.niu.edu/facdev/resources/guide/assessment/formative%20and\\_summative\\_assessment.pdf](http://www.niu.edu/facdev/resources/guide/assessment/formative%20and_summative_assessment.pdf)). Diagnostic assessment helps instructors determine students' current level of knowledge in a given area. A good example of this comes in the form of a pre-test, or survey. Formative assessment is dialogic process between the student and instructor and informs both about how well the student is learning what is being taught

(<http://arc.duke.edu/documents/The%20difference%20between%20assessment%20and%20evaluation.pdf>, para. 1). Summative assessment takes place after the learning is complete, and measures students understanding after being taught. Summative assessment is usually accompanied by a rubric given before the teaching starts. For my final capstone unit, I will incorporate all of these forms of assessment in order to evaluate students in their final semester at Cliff Valley. Table 7 details how each form of assessment will be implemented, and is accompanied by Table 8, which is the overall rubric for the entire unit that will be given to students.

**Table 8 Methods of Assessment**

8 <sup>th</sup> grade capstone unit assessment		
Method	How?	Who?
Diagnostic	Pre-Unit Survey of students interests, and artistic strengths	Student
Formative	In-process dialogue, feedback, and support. Also, group critique. Daily progress written in sketchbooks reflecting on process.	Student, Instructor, Group
Summative	Rubric given before each lesson in the unit, and also self-evaluation in sketchbook journal entries. Students assess each other at the end of the unit based on critiques and progress.	Student, Instructor, Group

## 5 DISCUSSION

Investigating curriculum development, and constructing a unit of lessons has contributed positively to my development as an art educator. While I have expanded my repertoire of curriculum development tools and resources, I plan to continue my research into art education models and frameworks, as well as art education capstone projects. There are still many challenges, tweaks, and modifications to be made whenever I might implement my unit, and formatively assess student reception and overall engagement. In this chapter, I reflect on my process of research and unit construction, and discuss future implications for implementing art capstone projects in the future.

### **Reflection**

For implementing the capstone unit for 8th grade, in which the students will have a great deal of creative freedom, researching the challenges choice based teachers face has helped me in designing and anticipating challenges students may face in directing, producing, and reflecting on their artwork and process. Having created a project-based capstone unit of lessons, there are still many challenges and obstacles to consider for further implementation

Researching various models of art education helped me to define exactly what kind of experience I wanted to leave my students with.. While I didn't find exactly what I was looking for, I was able to determine what exactly I wanted to create. Below I revisit my research questions and discuss discoveries I have made in the process of attempting to answer them.

1) Which models, frameworks, and approaches aligned with National Standards for Visual Arts would best address the mission of the school and meet the needs and interests of 8th grade students?

All of the literature reviewed references national standards, and many of the figures involved in the creation of these frameworks had a hand in art education policy reform. Some sources influenced, and continue to influence educational policy. In fact, DBAE/CAE were intended to reform art education, and heavily influenced educational policy, and inspired the creation of National Standards for Arts Education. Along with DBAE, Hetland's *Studio Habits of Mind* (2013) framework continues to influence art education policy. "...our framework guided the development of the new visual arts standards in Colorado and ensured that they focused on dispositions and not just skills" (p. 154). Hetland is referring to the design of the framework, intended to help students develop dispositions, and recognize opportunities for the application of the 8 studio skills. Hetland's (2013) framework provided learners the opportunity to not only develop authentic studio skills, but also develop the awareness, a way of seeing the world. These skills, Hetland argues, may well be transferrable to other arenas of academia, as well as many other kinds of study.

In creating a wish list of components I wanted to incorporate, social and emotional development are elements I wanted to include, but also come directly from the school's mission. Many of the models and frameworks reviewed did not explicitly state social and emotional development as learner outcomes. But, much like Hetland's attitudinal dispositions, these skills can be cultivated regardless of the framework of model employed if you look for the opportunity. As a result, social and emotional development were listed both student outcomes as well as strategies for the teacher. In creating the wish list I attempted to determine student outcomes, strategies for the instructor, and student processes I felt would satisfy my aims, and prepare students for their transition to other settings. To address students interests, I chose to keep the processes open to the students, so as to incorporate processes and materials students are

interested in exploring. I also tried to include those as many of the outcomes and processes as possible, while using the teacher strategies. As far as the outcomes, I feel that this capstone format will support the achievement of these outcomes.

2) How can I develop a successful unit geared toward the specific needs and learning goals of 8th students at Cliff Valley?

To determine what the specific needs and learning goals of 8<sup>th</sup> grade students are, I developed a diagnostic questionnaire that I hope to utilize prior to attempting a capstone unit with my students. I do not believe there to be one sacrosanct model or framework that can satisfy each student's specific needs and learning goals. Many models provide flexibility to accommodate a range of learning styles, but not necessarily a range of student interests. This would imply that any framework I wish to implement would need to be modified. While this was no new discovery for me, it did provide affirmation of the process I use when developing curricula for students, as I typically modify lessons to offer students more choices, and opportunities to create work that is personally meaningful.

Developmentally, students in grade 8 approach "The Period of Decision" (Lowenfeld, 1957). According to developmental theory, student near this age approach a period of development when students are more critical of themselves and their artwork. Their ability to recognize realism and desire to replicate their world develops faster than the ability to artistically portray their artwork in a realistic manner. Frustration ensues. As an art teacher, this stage of development is crucial in cultivating a love of the arts beyond their time at Cliff Valley, or in the least, a positive association with art making. It is my hope that providing the opportunity to identify and explore their own areas of interest, will allow students to create personally relevant work. This should only result in a meaningful project, but also encourage insights into the

process of creation, the habits of mind, so that students understand through experience, that the journey can be just as fruitful and meaningful as the finished product.

3) How might I structure a final project to provide a final meaningful experience for 8<sup>th</sup> grade students?

The discovery of capstone projects in secondary and post-secondary education heavily influenced the path of my research and lesson construction. With the moderate to exceptional ability of the school population, the challenge came in looking for manageable art education structures that could accommodate a range of interests and skill levels, without sacrificing cognitive depth. Choice-based art education, and TAB heavily influence the structure of the unit outline, but the most significant influence was the discovery of the capstone project framework.

### **Implications**

This study and construction of tables, outline of lessons, rubric, etc. were designed for my students in my school, specifically for my situation. While this study details the processes and methods of designing a unit of study for students in eighth grade, it also describes the need for further research. While this design and study pertains to my student, implementing a capstone project may be a worthwhile strategy for teachers to explore and adapt to their own situation. In developing this project and incorporating all of the aspects of my wish list, I provide some strategies that teachers should consider.

- While “play” does play an important role in cognitive and artistic development, the importance of helping students determine what area of interest they would like to explore cannot be overstated.
- Students should be considerate when working, they should know why they are doing what they are doing.

- In an ideal setting, there would be timeframe, or constraints of size and space. In reality, projects need to be manageable.
- Studio size and availability of materials does have an influence on what resources students have to explore.
- Making sure there is an identifiable relationship between student artwork and the artwork proposal gives students explicit criteria when creating imagery.
- It will still be up to the student as to how that relationship exists (i.e. conceptually, subject matter, inspiration).
- Formative assessment can be employed in the use of sketchbooks and group or individual critiques. This gives students the opportunity to reflect on progress and make changes as necessary.

### **Looking Forward**

For implementing the capstone unit for 8th grade, in which the students will have a great deal of creative freedom, researching the challenges choice based teachers face has helped me in designing and anticipating challenges students may face in directing, producing, and reflecting on their artwork and process.

This unit outline reflect contemporary and or current cultural trends, by fostering (For details, see Appendix A) fosters a maker-movement, do-it attitude. Many of the skills students will be developing while creating their capstone project reflect contemporary practices. C funding websites such as: [Kickstarter.com](http://Kickstarter.com), [gofundme.com](http://gofundme.com), [indiegogo.com](http://indiegogo.com), nurture entrepreneurial dispositions. Crowd funding platforms are also becoming viable means for individuals or communities to independently fund intellectual properties and projects. This process in which the students will participate in creating their capstone, echoes such initiatives

and prevalent cultural trends. The teacher will simply be the mediator and guide, providing appropriate demonstrations, suggestions, and considerations for students along the way.

## **Conclusion**

At the beginning of this study, I created a wish list of educational outcomes, and strategies and processes I would like my students to have before transitioning to high school. The amount of choice and creative freedom afforded by the structure of the capstone unit addresses nearly every element I wanted to address. In this regard, I feel I was successful in my exploration and creation of a final project, in including everything I set out to include in the final lesson. Ultimately, I will implement and formatively assess, to determine what modifications need be made.

Reviewing literature, organizing data sources, and creating foundational outlines for units of study has expanded my notion of curricular construction, and how, with a little investigating and question forming, educational frameworks can be tailored to suit the specific needs and goals of students. For students transitioning to high school, this artistic breath of fresh air will hopefully give my students the opportunity to reflect on their lives, and experiences at Cliff Valley, in a way that is positive and meaningful. For some students, the notion of changing learning environments may sound thrilling. For others, a cognitive dissonance may take place, which may foster a cynical attitude: “How am I to appreciate Cliff Valley, when the High School I am going to is the exact opposite of this school?” By creating works of art that incorporate personal experience and embodied knowledge, hopefully students will gain perspective and create meaning in response to their impending graduation, and change in educational setting.

Liminality is all around us. We lose ourselves, and construct ourselves, in a constant state of change. We let go of things we identify with once they no longer serve us, or conflict

with our current or emergent system of beliefs. But, what next? What do we do? My hope is that they will remember, with pride, the vulnerability of being in the stage “of becoming,” and the creative opportunity they had to express themselves through art. Hopefully the processes and choices students will experience will help them to prepare for making decisions in high school, and beyond.

## REFERENCES

- Anderson, T., Milbrandt, M.K. (2005). *Art for Life: Authentic Instruction in Art*. Boston: McGraw-Hill.
- Clements, R.D., Wachowiak, F. (2010). *Emphasis Art: A Qualitative Art Program for Elementary and Middle Schools*. 9th ed. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Douglas, K., Gaspardi, E.(2010). Art Education for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century. Paper presented at International VSA Festival. Washington, DC. Retrieved on December 15, 2015, from [http://www.kennedycenter.org/education/vsa/resources/Gaspardi\\_Ellyn\\_Arts\\_Education\\_for\\_the\\_21st\\_Century.pdf](http://www.kennedycenter.org/education/vsa/resources/Gaspardi_Ellyn_Arts_Education_for_the_21st_Century.pdf)
- Douglas, K. M., & Jaquith, D. B. (2009). *Engaging learners through artmaking: choice-based art education in the classroom*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Eisner, E.W. (2002). *The Arts and the Creation of Mind*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Eisner, E.W. (1994). *Cognition and Curriculum Reconsidered*. 2nd ed. New York: Teachers College.
- Gardner, H. (1990). *Art Education and Human Development*. Los Angeles, California: Getty Publications.
- Henry, C. (1990). Grading Student Artwork: A Plan for Effective Assessment. In B. Little (Ed.), *Secondary art education: An anthology of issues*. (pp. 61-68). Reston, Virginia: National Art Education Association.
- Hetland, L., Sheridan, K.M., Veenema, S., Winner, E. (2013). *Studio Thinking 2: The Real Benefits of Visual Arts Education*. 2nd ed. Reston, VA: National Art Education Association.

- Longmore, T. (2012). Supporting young artists as independent creators. In D. B. Jaquith & N. E. Hathaway (Eds.), *The learner directed classroom: Developing creative thinking skills through art* (pp. 56–63). New York: Teachers College Press.
- Lowenfeld, V., & Brittain, W. (1947). *Creative and mental growth*. New York: Macmillan.
- Morris, V.C. (1955). What Is a Curriculum? *The School Review*. Vol. 63, No. 3 (Mar., 1955), pp. 152-157. The University of Chicago Press.
- Stankiewicz, M. A. (2001). *Roots of art education practice*. Worcester, MA: Davis Publications.
- Stewart, M.G., Walker, S.R. (2005). *Rethinking Curriculum in Art*. Davis Publications, Inc., Worcester, Massachusetts.
- Stokrocki, M. (2005). *Interdisciplinary Art Education: Building Bridges to Connect Disciplines and Cultures*. Reston, VA: National Art Education Association.
- Szekely, G. E. (2012). Testing the world through play and art. In D. B. Jaquith & N. E. Hathaway (Eds.), *The learner directed classroom: Developing creative thinking skills through art* (pp. 64–78). New York: Teachers College Press.
- Teaching for Artistic Behavior. (n.d.). *Teaching for Artistic Behavior*. Retrieved February 4, 2015, from <http://teachingforartisticbehavior.org/http://teachingforartisticbehavior.org/>
- Wagenaar, T.C. (1993). The Capstone Course. *Teaching Sociology*, Vol.21, No. 3 (Jul., 1993), pp. 209-214. American Sociological Association.
- Walker, S.R. (2001). *Teaching Meaning in Artmaking*. Worcester, MA: Davis Publications, 2001.
- What is The Difference Between Assessment and Evaluation.*

Retrieved on June 18, 2015, from

<http://arc.duke.edu/documents/The%20difference%20between%20assessment%20and%20evaluation.pdf>

## APPENDICES

### Appendix A Sequence of Lessons

#### *Appendix A.1 Lesson 1*

Lesson 1 “Coming up with an Idea”				
Objectives	1) Student will explore artistic processes from a variety of artists and time periods 2) Student will present information to class, either in small group or individually			
Description	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Students will research and explore artistic process(es) of particular artist or time period, either individually or in small group, and present to class.</li> <li>• Student will consider areas of interest or exploration for consideration in a series of artworks.</li> </ul>			
Assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Formative assessment: While students are working</li> <li>• Summative assessment: After students have presented</li> <li>• Rubric below</li> </ul>			
	Below Grade Level	Needs Improvement	Progressing Well	Excelling
Exploring Processes Presentation	Student detailed few characteristics from time period, artist, and processes. Student was not thorough, and did not complete all of the questions from the worksheet	Student mostly detailed the time period, artist, processes and inspirations for the artist. Student was not thorough, and did not complete all of the questions from worksheet.	Student detailed the time period, artist, processes, and inspirations for the artist. Student presented each question from worksheet	Student detailed the time period, artist, processes and inspirations for the artist. Student went above and beyond, in thoroughly exploring and presenting each question from worksheet.

### Appendix A.2 Lesson 2

Lesson 2 “Writing a proposal”				
Objectives	1) Student will articulate in written form an art proposal describing their area of exploration, materials, processes, and inspiration			
Description	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Student will use information gathered from group presentations to create a proposal for exploration of a subject, or area of interest to create works of art.</li> </ul>			
Assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Formative Assessment: While students are working</li> <li>Summative assessment: Completed proposal</li> <li>For Rubric, see below</li> </ul>			
	Below Grade Level	Needs Improvement	Progressing Well	Excelling
Writing a Proposal	Student did not fully complete the proposal by answering all of the worksheet questions	Student answered some of the proposal questions. Idea needs further research or planning	Student answered all of the proposal questions. Student has provides thorough explanation of ideas	Student answers all of the proposal questions. Students has provided thorough explanation of ideas. Student went above and beyond by providing research related to field of exploration or idea.

### Appendix A.3 Lesson 3

Lesson 3 “Studio Time & Group Critique”				
Objectives	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Students will effectively use class time to explore areas of interest using art materials and methods</li> <li>2) Student will present idea, challenges, and concerns to class during group critique, and present work in process.</li> <li>3) Student will participate during group critique to provide insightful, constructive suggestions using appropriate vocabulary</li> </ol>			
Description	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• After writing a proposal, students will explore there area of interest using art materials and methods.</li> <li>• Student will critique the work of classmates, and present their work to classmates in a group setting.</li> </ul>			
Assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Formative Assessment: While students are working</li> <li>• Summative assessment: Overall participation during class discussions and group critique</li> <li>• For Rubric, See Group Critique</li> <li>• For Rubric, see Effort &amp; Craftsmanship</li> </ul>			
	Below Grade Level	Needs Improvement	Progressing Well	Excelling
Group Critique	Student does not use appropriate vocabulary, student participation is minimal during critique.	Student uses appropriate vocabulary during critique. Student participating is minimal during critique	Student uses appropriate vocabulary during critique. Student looks for opportunities to give insightful, considerate suggestions.	Student uses appropriate vocabulary during critique. Student looks for opportunities to give insightful, considerate suggestions. Student goes above and beyond during critiques to participate at every opportunity.
Effort & Craftsmanship	Student is not consistent in putting forth effort, or puts forth minimal effort. When working, student needs frequent reminders to stay on task. Student talks frequently and distracts others during studio time. Student does not go back to address items for improvement.	Student is somewhat consistent in putting forth effort. When working, student needs reminders to stay on task. Student talks frequently during studio time. Some items throughout unit need more work. Student does not go back and address items for improvement.	Student consistently puts forth their best effort in each class. Student stays focused during studio time.	Student consistently puts forth their best effort in each class. Student stays focused during studio time. Student goes above and beyond in looking for ways to improve their work.

### Appendix A.4 Lesson 4

Lesson 4 “Writing an artists statement”				
Objectives	1) Student will reflect on the process of creation, and write an artist statement informing the reader of their journey			
Description	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Students will describe the process of researching other artists and time periods, and coming up with ideas.</li> <li>• Student will reflect on the process of creating works of art and write a formal statement describing their artistic process.</li> </ul>			
Assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Formative Assessment: While students are writing</li> <li>• Summative Assessment: Completed Artists Statement</li> <li>• For Rubric, see Artists Statement</li> </ul>			
	Below Grade Level	Needs Improvement	Progressing Well	Excelling
Artists Statement	<p>Artist statement does not inform reader of artists intention. Statement does not relate to artwork in a clear, logical manner. Statement contains many grammatical and spelling errors. Statement does not mention media, inspiration, or artistic process. Statement needs further revision.</p>	<p>Artist statement relates to artwork. Artist statement does not inform reader of the artistic process well. Statement has few spelling and grammatical errors.</p>	<p>Artist statement informs the reader of the artists intention. Informs reader of ideas, inspiration, and artistic processes (including medium). Statement has few spelling and grammatical errors, if any.</p>	<p>Artist statement informs reader of the artists intention. Informs reader of ideas, inspirations, and the artistic process (including medium). Relates to artwork, in a clear and logical manner. Statement has been revised for grammar and spelling, with not spelling or grammatical errors. Student went above and beyond in linking work to other fields of study, or other artists who inspired student to create work.</p>

*Appendix A.4 Lesson 4 Cont'd.*

	Below Grade Level	Needs Improvement	Progressing Well	Excelling
Artwork	Artwork does not relate to original proposal. Student ignores feedback gained from critique to formatively assess progress and make changes as necessary.	Artwork relates to original proposal. Student does little to apply feedback gained from critique to formatively assess progress and make changes as necessary.	Artwork relates to original proposal. Student applies feedback gained from critique to formatively assess progress and make changes as necessary.	Artwork relates to original proposal. Student applies feedback gained from critique to formatively assess progress and make changes as necessary. Student goes above and beyond during production, to look for areas of improvement, or to add additional effort.
Sketchbook & Journal	Student is missing 3 or more daily entries in sketchbook. Student written goals for each day are not clear. Student does not reflect on progress for each day.	Student is missing 1 or 2 daily entries in sketchbook. Student written goals are somewhat clear for each day. Student reflects minimally on progress for each day.	Student completed goals and reflections for each day of working. Student does well at reflecting on progress and short term and long term goals	Student completed goals and reflections for each day of working. Student does well at reflecting on progress and short term and long term goals. Student goes above and beyond in reflections to provide meaningful insight and strategies for reaching goals

## Appendix B Student Questionnaire

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

1. What is your favorite lesson this year (in art/classroom)?
2. What is your favorite period of history (art/classroom)?
3. What is your strongest area academically?
4. What is your strongest area artistically?
5. What is your favorite art lesson?
6. What is your biggest weakness academically/artistically?
7. What is your strongest medium/process/area artistically?
8. What are you interested in?
9. What are your hobbies?
10. What would you like to know more about?
11. What issues in the world concern you most?
12. Which of the following themes mean the most to you? Circle all that apply.

### List of Themes

Emotions/Feelings	Food	Power	Family	Social Power
Imagination	Identity	Heroes	Change	My city
Communication	Nature	Love	Social	Personal
			Power	Experiences
Diversity	Expression	Dreams	Fear	Social
		& Fantasy		Conflict
Masculinity	Imagination	Feminism	Community	Relationships

**Appendix C Student Artwork Proposal Format**

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

1. Proposed subject, theme, or area of exploration:
  
2. Source of inspiration, creativity, or area of research:
  
3. Number of art works to be completed (minimum 1):
  
4. Size of artworks:
  
5. Medium (media) to be used:
  
6. Process(es) to be used:
  
7. How will you evaluate your success?
  
8. In your words, what will a successful project look like?

Instructor's Signature \_\_\_\_\_

Student's Signature \_\_\_\_\_

**Appendix D Exploring Process and Inspiration**

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

- 1.) What time period is your artist or art movement?
- 2.) What are some defining characteristics of your time period or art movement?
- 3.) If researching an art movement or time period, who were some notable artists?
- 4.) What are some processes used? (example: painting, drawing from observation)
- 5.) How did the artist(s) work?
- 6.) Did the artist make preliminary sketches or plan beforehand? If so, how?
- 7.) What was important to the artist?
- 8.) What were some messages the artist tried to convey?
- 9.) What were some sources of inspiration for the artist(s)?
- 10.) What was something you learned about this artist or time period that was unique?
- 11.) Additional comments:

## Appendix E Artists and Art Movements

### Art Movements and Time Periods

Abstraction

Realism

Cubism

Self-Portraiture

Photography

Modernism

Postmodernism

Religion around the world

Middle Ages

Renaissance

Ancient Art

Egyptian Art

Chinese Landscape Painting

Ancient Civilizations

Other:

### Example Artists throughout History

Leonardo DaVinci

Cindy Sherman

Jackson Pollock

Georgia O'Keefee

Salvador Dali

Renee Magritte

Mary Cassatt

Louise Nevelson

Rembrandt van Rijn

Johannes Vermeer

Hokusai

Winslow Homer

Claude Monet

Joan Miro

Other: