Stayers and the Leavers: The Identity of S/FL Teachers at a Time of Critical Shortage

Peter B. Swanson

Georgia State University, pswanson@gsu.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/mcl_facpub

Part of the Other Languages, Societies, and Cultures Commons

Recommended Citation
Swanson, Peter B., "Stayers and the Leavers: The Identity of S/FL Teachers at a Time of Critical Shortage" (2013). World Languages and Cultures Faculty Publications. 21.
https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/mcl_facpub/21

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Department of World Languages and Cultures at ScholarWorks @ Georgia State University. It has been accepted for inclusion in World Languages and Cultures Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of ScholarWorks @ Georgia State University. For more information, please contact scholarworks@gsu.edu.
Title: Stayers and the Leavers: The Identity of S/FL Teachers at a Time of Critical Shortage.

Author

Peter B. Swanson, PhD
Georgia State University

Stayers and the Leavers: The Identity of S/FL Teachers at a Time of Critical Shortage

In 1983, *A Nation at Risk* (National Commission on Excellence in Education, 1983) was published and set off an educational firestorm. Among its findings the authors stated that schools in the United States (US) were failing in part because not enough *academically able* students were being attracted to teaching as a career option. Around the same time researchers reported a severe teacher shortage of teachers in America’s schools (Boe & Gilford, 1992; Darling-Hammond, 1984; Haggstrom, Darling-Hammond, & Grissmer, 1988) and teachers of bilingual education and foreign languages topped the list in a national study (Boe, 1990). However, the need for language teachers was noted decades earlier both within and outside the US. Following World War II, United States President Dwight D. Eisenhower and Canadian Prime Minister Lester Pearson called for more foreign language teachers at all levels in order to increase the number of these professional in both countries (Flattau, Bracken, Van Atta, Bendeh-Ahmadi, de la Cruz, & Sullivan, 2006; Ray, 1978). Although public awareness may have been raised, research indicates that a shortage of language educators continues to exist despite persistent calls for more language teachers (American Association for Employment in Education, 2009; Karsenti, Collin, Villeneuve, Dumouchel, & Roy, 2008; Swanson, 2008b, 2010a).

Multiple factors have been shown to play a role in the second/foreign language (S/FL) teacher shortage and one that has received little attention is the identity of S/FL teachers and how such characteristics are related to one’s longevity in the profession. For the purposes of this chapter, whether individuals are teaching languages in a program termed as *foreign language*, *second language*, or even *immersion*, the teachers are collectively grouped as S/FL teachers because these professionals share the common goal of students acquiring the ability to communicate in meaningful and culturally appropriate ways in other languages (National
Standards in Foreign Language Education Project, 2006). Additionally, these educators endure similar professional challenges and responsibilities. This chapter begins with a review of the literature about the shortage of S/FL teachers, followed by an examination of S/FL teacher identity from several different perspectives. Afterward, S/FL teacher identity is discussed from a pragmatic psychosocial perspective juxtaposing teacher identity against ones’ decision to remain or leave the profession. Data from current research are presented from studies focused on pre-service and in-service S/FL teachers as well as adolescents participating in future educator groups. The chapter concludes with implications of this research and I discuss avenues for future research.

The S/FL Teacher Shortage

Historically, even with the creation of various programs to attract people into a career as S/FL teachers over the past 60 years, the shortage of language teachers remains to this day. Unfortunately, consensus regarding the causes for the shortage has not been achieved. Some have reported an imbalanced distribution of teachers (American Association for Employment in Education, 2006, 2009; EFA Global Monitoring, 2009; Voke, 2002) while others suggest that there is a surplus of certified teachers who actively choose not to teach (Darling-Hammond, 2001; Ingersoll, 2001). Despite the lack of agreement, America’s classrooms are in need of more S/FL teachers.

A review of the literature suggests that the shortage can be partly explained by task-related, individual, social, and socioeconomic factors. Such factors include issues of classroom management and working conditions, teachers’ emotional and psychological states as well as the characteristics of these individuals (i.e., time in the profession and gender), teachers’ lack of collaboration, professional networking opportunities, teachers’ poor relations with
administrators, and today’s uncertain global economic outlook (Borman & Dowling, 2008; Chaplain, 2008; Darling-Hammond, 2001, 2010; Guarino, Santibañez, & Daley, 2006; Ingersoll, 2001; Karsenti, Collin, Villeneuve, Dumouchel, & Roy, 2008; Ministère de l’Éducation du Québec, 2003; Romano, 2008). The socioeconomic factor (e.g., salary, benefits) is a recent addition to the literature because researchers have noted that during uncertain or even challenging economic times, teachers may choose to remain in the classroom regardless of professional discomforts in order to remain employed and maintain an income. Conversely, booming economic conditions or the prospect of such circumstances might encourage teachers to leave the classroom in pursuit of other employment opportunities (Karsenti, Collin, Villeneuve, Dumouchel, & Roy, 2008).

Among the aforementioned factors, teacher retirement, attrition, current legislation, current student enrollments, and the lack of active S/FL teacher recruitment initiatives have been found to have a serious impact on the S/FL teacher shortage. Research indicates that over half of US teachers are Baby Boomers and these individuals will be eligible for retirement over the next decade (Der Bedrosian, 2009). In order to fill these teaching positions, more than 2 million teachers will be needed to fill the vacancies (Howard, 2003; National Education Association, 2005; US Department of Education, 2011). Assuming equal distribution among all content areas, school districts will be challenged to hire a large number of S/FL educators to fill these vacancies as such positions are among the most difficult for which to hire (Murphy, DeArmand, & Guin, 2003; Owens, 2010).

Similar to the problems associated with teacher retirement is attrition. While it is generally known that approximately 50% of novice teachers in all content areas leave the profession in the first three years of service (Lambert, 2006), the novice period is not the only
time that teachers are likely to leave their schools. Second stage teachers — years five through 10 in the classroom — are equally susceptible to attrition (Donaldson, Johnson, Kirkpatrick, Marinell, Steele, & Szczesiul, 2008). It is at this time in the profession when motivated teachers who have become comfortable in the classroom identify few opportunities for professional growth and advancement, and subsequently leave in high numbers (Brandeis University, 2011).

Specific to S/FL teachers, the attrition rate is higher than other content areas. In a study of S/FL teachers, Konanc (1996) reported that in North Carolina, the attrition rate of S/FL teachers after two years of service was higher (22%) than with teachers in other content areas (15-18%). In terms of S/FL teacher longevity in the profession, language teachers had the highest rate of attrition after the second year (21%), the fifth year (38%), the tenth year (49%), and the fifteenth year (57%). In neighboring Georgia, the S/FL teacher attrition rate was lower (11%) than that of North Carolina, however, the S/FL teacher attrition rate is higher than the rate of attrition for teachers in other content areas in the state (Georgia Professional Standards Commission, 2006).

In addition to teacher retirement and attrition, current legislative initiatives and student enrollments in S/FL courses play a role in the teacher shortage. Since it became law, No Child Left Behind (NCLB) has been problematic because it requires all teachers in federal core academic areas, which includes S/FL instruction, to meet the highly qualified criteria. Furthermore, NCLB continues to focus on the core areas of reading and mathematics, which becomes equally challenging because these areas tend to receive the majority of the financial resources (Rosenbusch, 2005; Rosenbusch & Jensen, 2004). Researchers note that such an approach to education increases instructional time in the tested areas (mathematics and reading), decreases instructional time in the non-tested areas, such as language instruction, narrows the curriculum in terms of decreasing the number of elective courses students can take, and it
shortchanges foreign language learning in schools (Edwards, 2004; Glisan, 2005; Rosenbusch, 2005).

While the number of elective courses that can be offered is compromised, student enrollments in language courses are rising at both the K-12 and postsecondary levels. Draper and Hicks (2002) examined US public school enrollments over more than one hundred years (1890 - 2000) and reported that enrollments in French, German, and Spanish classes had increased from 16.3% to 42.5%. In US institutions of higher education, enrollments in more than 200 languages other than English grew by almost 13% between 2002 and 2006, yet most students are not typically studying languages at advanced-levels (Furman, Goldberg, & Lusin, 2007). However, the “number of teachers qualified to teach these individuals regardless of context or language is not meeting the demand” (Swanson, 2011a, p. 10).

Part of the reason that the number of qualified S/FL teachers is not meeting demand is due to the dearth of active initiatives to recruit people into the profession (Swanson, 2008a). The most common strategies to recruit individuals into the teaching profession include hosting career fairs, posting job vacancies on the Internet, and attempting to identify qualities of the most talented new staff members (Scheetz, 1995). Using a more proactive approach focused on the recruitment of secondary students studying foreign languages, the Alabama Association for Foreign Language Teachers encouraged French teachers to invite their best language students to the state meetings. At the conference, these prospective future language teachers had the opportunity to meet with other students and language teachers from around the state to learn more about the teaching profession (Spencer, 2003). In neighboring Georgia, the Double the Double initiative was created with the goal of doubling the number and diversity of S/FL teacher education graduates (Georgia State University, 2005). While official data are not available, the
department chair who oversees the program finds that enrollments and the diversity of the students in the program have nearly tripled from approximately 30 to more than 86 students since its inception (Swanson, 2011a). Unfortunately, the demand for foreign language teachers in the state exceeds supply. Cleary, these factors begin to explain the current S/FL teacher shortage. However, the shortage of S/FL teachers is a complex issue and I argue that the lack of S/FL teachers can be further explained by the notion of teacher identity.

Examining Teacher Identity

Interest in understanding teachers’ professional identity has generated a substantial body of research (Beijaard, Meijer, & Verloop, 2004; Bullough, 1997; Johnston, 2003; Knowles, 1992; Kompf, Bond, Dworet, & Boak, 1996; Pavlenko, 2003; Varghese, 2000). Originally, the concept of identity was drawn from two prominent sources: Mead’s (1934) symbolic interactionism and the work of the Danish-German-American psychologist Erikson (1968). Derived from American pragmatism, symbolic interactionism focuses on identity formation in social contexts and on the stages people pass through. That is, people tend to act toward things based on the meaning those things have for them, and these meanings are derived from social interaction and modified through interpretation (Blumer, 1969). Social interactionists are interested in how people create meaning during social interaction, how they present and construct identity, and how they define situations in the presence of others.

To Erikson (1968), identity is not something one has, rather it something that develops during one’s life via transactions with the environment. Credited with positing eight stages of human development, Erikson believed that humans pass through different stages from birth to death. Beginning with the Hope, Trust vs. Mistrust stage (age birth to one year) and continuing through the Wisdom, Ego Integrity vs. Despairs stage (65 years of age and beyond), Erikson
(1950) outlined a dynamic lifespan approach from which to examine one’s identity. He viewed the stages as a cycle with the end of one generation creating a new one. From a social context, his life stages were linear for an individual yet cyclical for the development of society.

While both Mead and Erikson have made generous contributions to understanding one’s identity, researchers in anthropology and sociology, as well as those in general education and language teaching, have broadened the notion of teacher identity by establishing three central tenets. First, identity is not a fixed, stable, and internally coherent phenomenon. Rather, it should be considered as transformational and transformative (Varghese, Morgan, Johnston, & Johnson, 2005). Additionally, teacher identity has social, cultural, and political contexts (Duff & Uchida, 1997). Finally, teacher identity is built and maintained through language and discourse (Gee, 1996; MacLure, 1993).

A review of the literature on teacher identity suggests that it is ever changing (Freese, 2006; Hoban, 2007; Olsen, 2008; Riopel, 2006) and a number of internal (e.g., emotion) and external factors (e.g., life and job experiences) play a role in its initial and subsequent development (Flores & Day, 2006; Rodgers & Scott, 2008; Sachs, 2005; van Veen & Sleegers, 2006; Zembylas, 2003). Beginning as student teachers, individuals undertake an identity shift as they move through teacher education programs and enter the workforce. Additionally, identity shifts may continue to occur throughout the teachers’ career due to interactions within schools and in broader communities (Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009). The notion of teacher identity is truly complex, and there are a variety of different approaches that can be taken to understand and appreciate the importance of studying teacher identity.

For example, Mitchell and Weber (1999) examined identity in terms of the constant *reinventing* of themselves that teachers undergo. However, Hunt (2006) examined the metaphors
that may guide or result from teachers’ understanding of the professional role while Flores and Day (2006) sought to understand teacher identity in terms of the influence of a wide range of contextual factors on teachers and their practice. Yet others have studied identity in terms of the variety of discourses in which teachers participate and produce (Alsup, 2006) and the narratives that teachers create in order to explain themselves and their teaching lives such as Søreide’s (2006) study of Norwegian elementary school teachers.

Based on ontological narratives (Somers & Gibson, 1994), she investigated identity constructions when the teachers talked about their jobs. That is, the stories people tell in an effort to make sense of how they experience themselves and how they would like to be understood in order to bring structure to their personal lives. Theoretically grounded in poststructuralist and discourse theory combined with theories of narrative identity, four major constructions of teacher identity emerged: (1) the caring and kind teacher, (2) the creative and innovative teacher, (3) the professional teacher, and (4) the typical teacher. While the first identity construction seems to be an important identity resource for teachers when they present themselves, the second construction positions the teacher as very much oriented towards new ideas about school and teaching. The professional teacher suggests that teachers can separate their private life and working hours and that the individual knows where professional responsibilities start and where they stop. The final construction, the typical teacher, represents the teacher as one who is a very responsible, structured person with good order, although somewhat boring with little sense of humor.

Søreide (2006) argues that while the four identity constructions “might strike those who are somewhat familiar with teachers and their job as common sense” (p. 543), she feels that this poststructuralist approach to understanding teacher identity makes it more likely that one can
discover and take more seriously the challenges the teachers meet in their everyday life in schools. Furthermore, she believes that the illumination and description of everyday assumptions, self-images, and beliefs can help people increase their ability to recognize and understand systems of power within institutions and discourses. Søreide argues that such recognition can become helpful if educational stakeholders wish to make changes with practical consequences.

Clearly, there is value to studying teacher identity because it can be used as a lens through which to examine different aspects of teaching (Beauchamp & Thomas, 2009). Its study promotes understanding of how people not only to integrate a range of influences, it also aides in the understanding of teachers’ confrontations with sources of tension and contradiction in their careers (Olsen, 2008). Additionally, the study of one’s identity can help teachers “explain, justify and make sense of themselves in relation to others, and to the world at large” (MacLure, 1993, p. 311), which can be critical at a time of a teacher shortage.

Second/Foreign Language Teacher Identity

It has been argued that the value ascribed to speech cannot be understood apart from the person who speaks because the person who speaks cannot be understood apart from larger networks of social relationships (Bourdieu, 1977). Every time people speak, they are negotiating and renegotiating a sense of self in relation to the larger social world. Much like the literature on teacher identity in general, researchers studying the identity of S/FL teachers examine the social, historical, and cultural contexts in which language learning and teaching take place, and how at times these individuals negotiate and even resist the diverse positions those contexts provide them (Block, 2003; Duff & Uchida, 1997). This research represents a shift in the field of language education from a focus on psycholinguistic models of language acquisition to include

Of these perspectives, three theories have gained attention in the literature: Hogg and Abrams’ (1998) social identity theory, Lave and Wenger’s (1991) theory of situated learning, and Simon’s (1995) concept of the image-text. The first, social identity theory, promotes the notion of identity based on social categories to which people belong within and between multiple groups. Sherman, Hamilton, and Lewise (1999) posit that if an individual identifies with a negatively valued group, for even a short while, it will have a negative impact on his/her self-esteem. Likewise, the second theory underscores the importance of social interaction. According to Lave and Wenger, situated learning is a function of the activity, context and culture in which it occurs (i.e., it is situated). Teachers become part of a community of practice whereby individuals move from the periphery of the community as novices to the center as they become more active and involved. Such communities consist of multiple identities and levels of participation where teachers “share understandings concerning what they are doing and what that means in their lives and for their communities” (Lave & Wenger, 1991, p. 98).

Unlike the first two theories, Simon (1995) situates teacher identity as a form of pedagogy. According to Simon, an image-text is created on a daily basis in schools and reflects the close and affective relationships that develop between teachers and their students. The image becomes a portrait of teachers that are shaped by student interpretations of observable and imperceptible factors such as student-teacher interaction, instructional practices, teachers’ life
stories, gestures, and attitudes. Such a poststructuralist view suggests that teachers are in part invisible to themselves. Simon posits that students *read* teachers and respond in ways of which teachers may not be aware. While these three theoretical views of teacher identity certainly provide interesting perspectives, other viewpoints need to be considered, especially in terms of juxtaposing one’s identity against critical problems faced by the profession.

Theory of Vocational Personalities and Work Environments

Dating back to Mead’s era, researchers posited that behavior depends on both personality and environments (Murray, 1938) and that there was merit in organizing human knowledge according to occupational codes (Darley, 1938). Working from such premises, researchers began to develop interest inventories and reported the existence of six distinct dimensions of human interests using comprehensive factor analysis: scientific, social, language-literary, mechanical, business, and artistic (Cottle, 1950; Guilford, Christensen, Bond, & Sutton, 1954; Strong, 1943). Inspired by such findings, Holland began researching the person/environment fit—the congruence between one’s interests and the workplace environment. He developed the *Vocational Preference Inventory* (Holland, 1958) as a career guidance tool that categorized people and workplace environments in a circular six factor typology similar to those theorized earlier: Realistic (R), Investigative (I), Artistic (A), Social (S), Enterprising (E), and Conventional (C).

The notion of a circular six factor typology was examined by comparing interest inventories such as the *Kuder Occupational Interest Survey* (Kuder, 1966), the *Minnesota Vocational Interest Inventory* (Clark & Campbell, 1965), and the *Strong Interest Vocational Blank* (Strong, 1943) to Holland’s *Vocational Preference Inventory*. In addition to finding that Holland’s configuration was present in the other instruments, researchers determined that the
Vocational Preference Inventory also had more explanatory power than the other instruments (Cole & Hanson, 1971). Holland (1997) reported that the six types of personalities were analogous in some ways to personality types proposed much earlier such as Adler (1939), Fromm (1947), Jung (1933), and Spranger (1928). Today, the typology is known widely as the RIASEC model and Holland’s Self-Directed Search has replaced his Vocational Preference Inventory because it uses a broader range of content-activities, competencies, occupations, and self-ratings to assess a person’s resemblance to each personality type (Holland, 1997).

Additionally, the circular structure of the model was replaced by a hexagonal model following additional empirical testing and examination (Holland, 1997). After more than 50 years of research by Holland and others, his theory of Vocational Personalities and Work Environments (Holland, 1997) not only revolutionized the field, it has also had profound influence on other psychologists (Gottfredson, 1999).

Holland’s (1997) theory is based on four premises. First, most people can be categorized as one of six personality types: Realistic, Investigative, Artistic, Social, Enterprising, and Conventional. Each of the six types is the product of a host of cultural and personal forces including peers, parents, culture, biological heredity, social class, and the physical environment. Second, there are six model environments: Realistic, Investigative, Artistic, Social, Enterprising, and Conventional. Third, people search for environments that will let them exercise their abilities and skills, express their attitudes and values, and take on agreeable problems and roles. Finally, behavior is determined by an interaction between people’s personalities and the environment. Holland suggests that in order for individuals to have an increased chance of finding career success and satisfaction there must be congruence between one’s interests and one’s workplace. For example, Holland’s theory suggests that the most congruent work situation for an
Enterprising individual would be within an Enterprising environment. Holland’s theory has been tested in hundreds of empirical studies (Feldman, Smart, & Ethington, 2004), and by using knowledge of an individual’s personality pattern and the pattern of his or her environment, outcomes to such pairings can be predicted.

As mentioned earlier, Holland depicts the relationship among the six factors (i.e., domains) using a hexagonal model (Figure 1). The Holland hexagon serves three purposes. *Figure 1. Holland Hexagon (Holland, 1997).*

First, it defines the degree of consistency in an individual’s personality pattern. The two highest scale scores on the *Self-Directed Search* (SDS, described later) can be considered as having one of three levels of consistency: profile patterns compiled from the SDS where a person holds adjacent points on the hexagon are most consistent (that is, some pairs are more closely related than others). For example, a person that has a personality profile that has Social and Enterprising as the two highest scale scores is deemed consistent according to the theory. Contrarily, profile patterns composed on opposite sides of the hexagon are least consistent, such as Social and
Realistic. Patterns following other types are said to have an intermediate level of consistency. The more closely related the two highest scale scores are, the stronger the individual’s personality profile becomes.

Second, the hexagon defines the consistency of the workplace environment in the same manner. For example, Social environments are said to be cooperative and helpful, whereas Realistic environments lack human relations ability (Holland, 1997). Finally, the hexagon defines the degrees of congruence between person and environment, which was based on Linton’s (1945) notion that a major portion of the force of the environment is transmitted through other people. According to Holland (1997), the hexagon can be used to determine degrees of consistency and congruence and to predict the expected outcomes related to job satisfaction, achievement, and change in jobs. As for teachers, theory places these professionals and their workplace in the Social domain (Holland, 1997). Thus, teachers with Social high scores on the SDS are most compatible in schools, which are highly Social workplace environments.

*Self-Directed Search Inventory*

The *Self-Directed Search Form R* (Holland, Fritzsche, & Powell, 1994) is a career guidance survey that was designed to assist adolescents and adults in making career and education choices that are aligned with their interests and abilities. Over the years it has been tested with a variety of groups to verify its integrity, especially in terms of gender and ethnic biases, and it has been found to be consistent with the theoretical predictions (Benninger & Walsh, 1980; Fishburne & Walsh, 1976; Holland, Powell, & Fritzsche, 1994; Ward & Walsh, 1981). Moreover, its reliability and validity have been tested and found to be significant (Holland, 1997).
The SDS is composed of the aforementioned six subscales that measure a person’s interests, and is easy to complete and score (approximately 15-20 minutes). A person marks if he or she likes or dislikes certain activities, has/does not have certain competencies, and the individual offers a self-rating of different skills. In order to determine the interest profile, the person totals the number of items for each of the six domains. For example, to find one’s Investigative score, an individual adds all of the Investigative items marked “Like” or “Yes” for Activities, Competencies, and Occupations sections as well as the two numbers circled for Investigative in the Self-Estimates section. The individual’s personality profile is determined by rank ordering the totals for the six subscales from the highest (50 maximum) to the lowest (0 minimum). For example, Table 1 shows a person’s summary scores on the SDS. The person’s Holland code is Social, Enterprising, Artistic (S-E-A) and it is adequately differentiated. That is, there is a clear degree of difference between the first and second highest-rated interests. Holland recommends a minimum eight-point difference to be considered adequately differentiated. Differentiation speaks to how closely a person resembles one type or his/her resemblance to multiple types or no one single type at all. When using the SDS for research purposes, Holland (1997) recommends working only with the first three highest-ranked domains for smaller studies because extremely large samples are needed for empirical studies using all six classifications. Additionally, Holland recommends that individuals “rearrange the code letters in all possible ways to explore occupations under those three letter codes” (Holland, Powell, & Fritzsche, 1994, p. 268) to enhance the congruency between interests and the workplace environment. For more
detailed information about the SDS and to see a copy, see Holland, Fritzsche, & Powell (1994) and Holland (1997) respectively.

Current Research on S/FL Teacher Identity and Longevity in the Profession

While many factors account for one’s choice to remain in or leave the teaching profession, two of the most prominent dynamic factors in the decision-making process appear to be the intersection of the person/environment fit and one’s sense of efficacy. Self-efficacy, a strand of Social Cognitive Theory (Bandura, 1997), is grounded in human agency in which people are agents proactively engaged in their own development and can make things happen by their actions. Among other personal attributes, people have beliefs that allow them to exercise control over their thoughts, feelings, and actions. Bandura (1986) advances the notion that among the mechanisms of personal agency, none is more central than people's beliefs about their capabilities to exercise control over events that affect their lives. Self-efficacy beliefs function as an important set of proximal determinants of human motivation, affect, and action. Self-efficacy is a future-oriented belief about the extent of competence individuals expect to exert in given situations. Such beliefs effect people’s emotions and thought patterns that facilitate courses of action in which people employ substantial effort when pursuing personal goals, persist when confronted with adversity, rebound from temporary setbacks, and exercise some degree of control over events that affect their lives (Bandura, 1997).

A strong sense of self-efficacy appears to be a fundamental factor in the attainment of further competencies and success. Bandura (1994) posits that individuals who enter adulthood poorly equipped with skills and consumed with self-doubts might find many aspects of adulthood stressful and discouraging, especially in terms of career choice. Abrupt change in the workplace can prompt the need for improved problem-solving skills and resilient self-efficacy to
cope effectively with new demands and stressors. During professional preparatory phases, an individual’s perceived self-efficacy can determine in part how well he/she will develop the basic cognitive, self-management and interpersonal skills on which careers are based. Such beliefs concerning a person’s capabilities and competencies are influential determinants of their career selections and their vocational success or subsequent lack of success.

Bandura (1994) suggests that early adulthood is a period when people have to learn to cope with many new demands that arise from having chosen a career and a solid sense of self-efficacy is an important contributor to the attainment of occupational success. While career selection is an important step in life, it is another matter to do well and advance in the chosen profession. Bandura (1994) proposes that psychosocial skills contribute more heavily to career success than do occupational technical skills. An individual’s development of skills in managing one's motivation, emotional states and thought processes increases perceived efficacy. That is, the higher the sense of self-regulatory efficacy, the better the occupational functioning. Conversely, the lower the sense of self-regulatory efficacy, the worse the occupational functioning becomes (Bandura, 1994). Thus, the investigation of the compatibility of a person’s vocational interests and one’s sense of efficacy within the work environment may help explain more about the S/FL teacher shortage.

In order to investigate the intersection of career satisfaction, self-efficacy, and longevity in the profession, I began investigating the relationship between S/FL teachers’ vocational interests and how such interests are related to teacher satisfaction and choice to remain or leave the profession (Swanson, 2008a). Based on Holland’s (1997) recommendation of using with small sample sizes for exploratory studies, I studied in-service S/FL teachers in Wyoming. Based on Gottfredson’s (2002) notion that part of Holland’s SDS scales are efficacy beliefs — an
individual’s judgment of his/her capabilities to organize and execute courses of action required to attain designated types of performances (Bandura, 1986) — I set out to validate Holland’s (1966) personality profile (i.e., Holland Code) for foreign language teachers ($N = 80$).

After confirming Holland’s suspicion that S/FL teachers pertained to the Social, Artistic, and Enterprising Holland code, I juxtaposed the teachers’ personality profile to their sense of efficacy using Tschannen-Moran and Woolfolk Hoy's (2001) Teacher Sense of Efficacy Scale. Data analysis showed that only the Social, Artistic, and Enterprising domains were directly related to one’s teaching efficacy in general terms and longevity in the profession (Swanson, 2008b). That is, those who had the Social, Artistic, and Enterprising Holland code and a higher sense of efficacy in the areas of student engagement, instructional strategy, and classroom management were veteran teachers. Novice educators had a lower sense of efficacy and many did not have the newly-established Holland code for S/FL teachers. The findings support the notion that teachers with a higher sense of efficacy are more likely to fear failure less, persevere longer in the face of obstacles, and equally important, they are more likely to remain in the classroom (Burley, Hall, Villeme, & Brockmeier, 1991; Glickman & Tamashiro, 1982). Also, the findings support the notion of the person/environment fit because of the congruency between the teachers’ interests (Social) and the workplace (Social).

Next, due to a dearth of research on S/FL teacher efficacy, I developed the Foreign Language Teacher Efficacy Scale (FLTES) in order to measure specifically S/FL teachers’ sense of efficacy in teaching languages and then test the instrument alongside the SDS. Following Bandura’s (1997) suggestion to avoid the generality of what most measures of teachers’ sense of efficacy offer, the scale focused on teachers’ self-perceptions of their abilities identified as components of the Communication goal of the National Standards for Foreign Language
Learning (National Standards in Foreign Language Education Project, 2006). Based on the American Council on the Teaching of Foreign Languages’ three modes of communication, survey items sought to measure S/FL teachers’ abilities within the interactive process of the three modes: Interpersonal, Interpretive, and Presentational. I did not include survey items based on discrete language structures such as phonology, morphology, syntax, grammar, and lexicon of the target language because the three modes of communication tap into teachers’ assessments of their competencies across the range of linguistic skills taught in FL classrooms. At this time I did not include survey items designed to measure specifically the teaching of culture because the literature suggested that culture is imbedded in instruction and is not considered a separate skill (Lee & VanPatten, 2003).

I tested the instrument alongside Tschannen-Moran and Woolfolk Hoy’s (2001) Teacher Sense of Efficacy Scale for validity purposes with K-12 language teachers (N = 441) from 11 states in the southeast United States (AL, AR, FL, GA, KY, LA, MS, NC, SC, TN, VA). Among the findings, I reported the discovery of two separate dimensions of S/FL teacher efficacy: content knowledge and the facilitation of instruction (Swanson, 2010a). Satisfied that the instrument was a valid and reliable instrument to measure teachers’ sense of efficacy in teaching languages, I sought to study differences in S/FL teacher efficacy based on people’s intention to remain or leave the profession. In two separate studies using the FLTES, I reported finding the same two dimensions of S/FL teaching reported earlier (content knowledge and facilitation of instruction). Additionally, I reported that S/FL teachers with a higher sense of efficacy in teaching languages were much more likely to persist in the profession than those with a lower sense of efficacy (Swanson, 2010b, Swanson & Huff, 2010).
However, during the process of submitting the research for publication consideration, one reviewer argued that the teaching of culture may be a separate dimension of one’s teaching ability. To test the hypothesis, I reconceptualized the FLTES by including statements regarding the teaching of culture based on the national standards for foreign language learning. The new instrument, the Second/Foreign Language Teacher Efficacy Scale (S/FLTES), was tested using a large-scale research design on language teachers in the US and Canada. The S/FLTES was placed alongside the Teacher Sense of Efficacy Scale again for construct validity purposes. Additionally, participants were asked to fill out Holland’s SDS. Participants were requested to note if they planned to remain or leave the profession at the end of the academic year.

Data analysis revealed several interesting findings. First, the S/FLTES could be considered a reliable and valid instrument to measure teacher efficacy. Second, factor analysis of the S/FLTES revealed that cultural instruction was indeed a third separate dimension of S/FL teaching along with content knowledge and the facilitation of instruction (Swanson, 2012). Third, the data showed that the teachers who indicated that they were going to remain in the profession had the Social, Artistic, and Enterprising Holland code, an iteration of it, or a high Social score in the highest two scale scores (Swanson, in press). However, the leavers did not. The personality profiles of those indicating that they were going to quit the profession in pursuit of other vocational preferences were incongruent with the workplace environment. Additionally, their Holland codes lacked differentiation and consistency. That is, some of these individuals either had vocational interests found in many of Holland’s domains or they lacked interest equally in all domains. Moreover, some had stable Holland codes, but their interests did not match the workplace environment. For example, several S/FL teachers had well-differentiated personality profiles. One participant, a female, had high Realistic and Conventional interests.
However, she was employed in a Social environment (schools) instead of a Realistic or Conventional one. For these individuals, the lack of the person/environment fit appeared to contribute to vocational instability and promoted notions of changing careers, which is consistent with Holland’s theory.

In addition to research focused on in-service S/FL teachers, there is a nascent line of research conducted on adolescents as they begin to ponder becoming S/FL teachers as well as research on pre-service S/FL teacher candidates. It is theorized that that adolescents begin to crystallize vocational preference between ages 14 and 18 and then career specification begins to take place between the ages of 18 and 21 (Super, 1990). To that end, I investigated students participating in future educator groups and reported two interesting findings (Swanson, 2009). First, there is a significant change in vocational interests between ages 15 and 16. That is, high school students’ vocational interests were no longer equally distributed among Holland’s six domains; graphic representation showed peaks and valleys among the RIASEC scales, indicating that these individuals had increased (decreased) interest in various fields. In a separate study of students in future educator groups (Swanson, 2011b), I reported that these individuals’ vocational interests (Social) were aligned closely with the workplace environment (Social). Their Holland code was Social, Enterprising, Artistic, and it was well-differentiated, and it was similar to Gottfredson and Holland’s (1996) classification for teachers in general (Social, Artistic, Enterprising). Additionally, when the Holland code was compared analytically to earlier findings for the in-service S/FL teachers, the personality profiles and total differentiation were remarkably comparable (Swanson, 2011a). While the sample included a mere few future S/FL teachers, they did share the same Holland code for S/FL teachers, which suggests that these
grow-your-own teacher programs are a collection point for individuals whose vocational interests are congruent with the workplace environment.

Turning to pre-service S/FL teacher candidates, I studied individuals in our S/FL teacher education program. The research tested the hypothesis that individuals who did not have the Social, Artistic, and Enterprising Holland code would be less likely to remain in the teacher education program and ultimately in the teaching profession. Students \( n = 73 \) were administered the SDS as part of class assignment dealing with teacher identity. Data collected over several semesters indicated that pre-service S/FL teachers without the Social, Artistic, Enterprising Holland code or an iteration of it were much more likely to either drop out of the program, not complete the program in a timely manner, or leave the profession within the first two years.

Concluding Thoughts

In isolation, theories of teacher identity have their limitations; however, an openness to multiple theoretical approaches can allow for a richer and more useful understanding of the processes and contexts of teacher identity (Varghese, Morgan, Johnston, & Johnson, 2005). An array of different theoretical approaches to understanding teacher identity has emerged since Mead’s and Erikson’s work by focusing on different aspects such as people’s language and discourse and their social, cultural, and political contexts (Duff & Uchida, 1997; Gee, 1996; MacLure, 1993). The shift from a focus on psycholinguistic models of language acquisition to broader models including sociological and anthropological dimensions of language learning appear to offer those richer and more useful understandings of teacher identity. However, while it is important to understand how language teachers form their identities in communities such as in their teacher education programs and later in their schools and classrooms (Varghese, Morgan,
Johnston, & Johnson, 2005), it is critical to understand more about teacher identity as it relates to the person’s success or lack of success in the profession. Holland’s theory that the greater the congruency or compatibility between a person and his/her work environment appears is one of these models that offer promise at a time of a critical shortage of S/FL teachers.

While the literature review indicates that multiple factors help explain the S/FL teacher shortage in the US, teacher attrition combined with the lack of active teacher recruitment initiatives continue to fuel the shortage in other developed nations. Research finds that annual teacher attrition rates for all content areas can vary from approximately 3% to 30% in Canada (Fédération canadienne, 2004; Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development, 2005) to 40-44% in the United Kingdom (Dolton & van der Klaauw, 1995; Stoel & Thant, 2002). Assuming relatively equal dispersion across all content areas, the rate of attrition for S/FL teachers, not to mention the dearth of active teacher recruitment initiatives, appears to be cause for alarm.

Holland’s theory and his Self-Directed Search inventory have practical implications for recruitment and retention of S/FL teachers. Bandura (1994) argues that while it is one thing to choose a profession, it is another to excel in it. Holland’s theory suggests that if a person’s interests are congruent with the workplace, there is a greater that the individual will find success, experience career satisfaction, and remain in the profession. Data from numerous empirical studies support such a notion and the research has implications for the profession. First, more career guidance is needed for adolescents and adults alike. Guidance counselors in both secondary and postsecondary settings, as well as S/FL language education program directors, could provide opportunities for students to take a vocational preference inventory and learn more about Holland’s theory of vocational interests as related to the workplace environment. While the
SDS has been described in detail, other career guidance surveys like the *Strong-Campbell Interest Inventory* (Hansen & Campbell, 1985) could be used to identify prospective educators either at the midpoint of their high school careers or even later. Such a strategy would be imperative for adolescents as they ponder career options, undergraduates who have not declared majors, or even military personnel who investigate teaching as a profession. Additionally, using such instruments would help students enrolled in professional programs as a measure to help students understand more about how their interests are congruent/incongruent with their selected professions. People’s Holland codes could be established and then explored using the *Dictionary of Holland Occupational Codes* in order to help offer career counseling and perhaps even improve the chances for career satisfaction.

Second, it is important that people who are considering becoming teachers have a strong Social component to their personality profile. Schools are classified as Social environments (Holland, 1997) and Social types working in these settings appear to have a much better chance to experience career satisfaction and success professionally. Although the SDS has been found to be consistent with the theoretical predictions in terms of gender and ethnic (Benninger & Walsh, 1980; Fishburne & Walsh, 1976; Holland, Powell, & Fritzsche, 1994; Ward & Walsh, 1981), research has shown that females tend to have higher Social scores and men tend to have higher Realistic scores (Holland, 1997). However, the males who remain in the profession have high Social scores on the SDS too (Swanson, 2008a, 2008b, 2010b, 2011a). Therefore, it is important that individuals considering becoming S/FL teachers have elevated Social scores.

While much has been learned from studying teacher identity using Holland’s model of the person/environment fit, more research is warranted. It would be informative to learn more about the development of adolescents’ interests with respect to the teaching profession and what
part(s) of the profession motivate(s) these individuals to consider becoming a teacher. Furthermore, similar research about professional motivation with pre-service educators would be useful to better understand what encourages or discourages pre-service educators from joining the profession because many new teachers choose to not teach (Ingersoll, 2003). Additionally, more research on in-service S/FL teachers is needed because some of these individuals remain as teachers even though their Holland codes are incongruent with the Social, Artistic, Enterprising personality profile. Is it due to economic reasons as posited earlier (Karsenti, Collin, Villeneuve, Dumouchel, & Roy, 2008) or do these individuals find professional satisfaction even though their vocational interests may not be rewarded in the profession?

Since World War II a S/FL teacher shortage has existed despite calls to increase the number of qualified language teachers. Several million new teachers will be needed in the next few years (Howard, 2003; National Center for Education Statistics, 2002; US Department of Education, 2011) and solutions are needed to identify more high quality instructors and keep them in the profession. Perhaps vocational guidance instruments hold a key not only to understanding those in the profession, but also to providing insight into how to increase the number of S/FL teachers at a time of critical need.
Stayers and the Leavers

References


Der Bedrosian, J. (2009, April 7). A 'tsunami' of boomer teacher retirements is on the horizon. *USA Today*, 5d.


Stayers and the Leavers ...


---

1 Teachers must have: a bachelor’s degree, full state certification or licensure, and prove that they know each subject they teach (US Department of Education, 2004).